

scrutiny



A Report of: Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee



Annual Report 2013 – 2014

June 2014



The City of Cardiff Council

CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Sue Lent
(Chairperson)



Councillor Paul Chaundy



Councillor Chris Davis



Councillor Jonathan Evans



Councillor Dianne Rees



Councillor Jim Murphy



Councillor Jo Boyle



Councillor Edward Stubbs



Councillor Cecelia Love

Co-opted Members:



Mrs P Arlotte
Roman Catholic
Representative



Vacant
Church in Wales
Representative



Mrs Catrin Lewis
Parent Governor
Representative



Vacant
Parent Governor
Representative

During the Year the following have been members of the Committee – Councillor Hawkins, Kelloway and Mr Jukes.

CHAIR'S FOREWORD

This year the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee has been extremely busy, with full committee meetings, a 'Call-in', task and finish inquiry meetings, visits to service areas, work programme forums and listening day for looked after children 11 and under. In addition, the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee has met in joint session with the Community and Adult Services Committee to scrutinise areas of common interest such as the Director of Social Services Annual Report.

The Committee has monitored 'formal business' including the Education Business Plan, Children's Services Business Plan, Families First, ESTYN monitoring re-visit, Children's Service Performance Management, South Central Consortium and the Integrated Family Support Team Annual Report. In the area of pre-decision scrutiny the committee has fully scrutinised 'Review of the Children's Library Service, the proposed budget for children's services, education service, youth service, and children's play, plus the proposed closure of the Council Nursery. In terms of policy development, the committee has explored working with Cardiff Youth Council, Adoption Service, and the Cardiff and Vale Safeguarding Board.

An inquiry into Child Health and Disability followed concerns from parents around access to services as well as problems in the social work team. The inquiry was focused on looking at models of good practice and a report was published earlier in the Year. The Committee received a timely and comprehensive response to the Committee's recommendations. I am very grateful to the committee members who agreed to take part in this inquiry at such short notice.

The Scrutiny Committee held a further listening event this year, following the two successful events in 2012/13. This event was organised by young people in partnership with the advocacy service, Tros Gynnal. The young people aged 11 and under, planned the workshops and advertised the event with the aim of ensuring young people felt comfortable to talk about their experiences. The event took place at the County Hall. The event was extremely successful and the feedback from the children was that they would like the committee to hold similar events in the future. The report

for the listening event recommended to Cabinet that it ensures that decision makers regularly engage with looked after children when considering the development and implementation of looked after children strategies, policies and plans, the report also included a number of comments and advice from the Children in respect of their care and support provided by the Council.

Other inquiries included the review of the role and status of Corporate Parenting, which was undertaken in partnership with the Corporate Parenting Panel and a review of the support and services provided for care leavers' transition to independent living.

Most recently, following a Council debate the Committee has been undertaking a joint inquiry with the Community and Adult Services Committee into Tackling Human Trafficking in Cardiff. Members heard from local agencies, the Police and the Crown Prosecution Services, and third sector agencies. Members have met with council officers and Cabinet Members covering social services, education and housing services. The inquiry is currently considering their key findings and recommendations.

I would like to take this opportunity to express my thanks to the members who have participated in the work of the Committee; the co-opted members who have given their time, the many witnesses, from within the Council and from external bodies and organisations, who have attended the Committee's proceedings and the research and scrutiny officers who have provided invaluable support to the Committee.

Councillor Sue Lent

Chairperson of the Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee

June 2014

INTRODUCTION

The Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service and policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of Education, Social Care for Children, and the Youth Service.

This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2013-14 and wherever possible identifies the impact that the Committee has had on the services and support networks they have examined.

Between June 2013 and April 2014 the Committee Members have undertaken specialist training in performance information and budgeting and visited front line services. The Committee has scrutinised a wide range of topics contributing to the development and improvement of services for children and young people, a list of which is set out below under the following headings:

- **Inquiries** – Where the Committee has undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet.
- **Policy Development** – Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes by considering draft policy documents.
- **Pre-decision** - Where the Committee has evaluated and commented on policy proposals before they go to the Cabinet, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision.
- **Monitoring** - Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance and progress in implementing actions previously agreed.
- **Call-In** - Where a Member has invoked the Call-in procedure under the Council's constitution, to review a Cabinet decision prior to its implementation.

Inquiries

- ❖ The Impact of Poverty on Educational Attainment
- ❖ Child Health and Disability
- ❖ Corporate Parenting
- ❖ Looked After Children under the age of 11 – Listening event
- ❖ Looked After Children's Transition to Independent Living.

Policy Development

- ❖ Working with the Youth Council – Young People's perspective on the budget proposals.

Pre-decision

- ❖ Social Impact Bonds
- ❖ Joint Cardiff and Vale Safeguarding Board
- ❖ Welsh Education Strategic Plan
- ❖ Budget Proposals
 - Budget Information Packs
 - Budget Monitoring
 - Budget Proposals
 - County Hall Nursery Provision
 - Provision of Children's Library Service.

Monitoring

- ❖ Children's Service Business Plan 2013 - 14
- ❖ ESTYN Inspection
 - Improvement up to and beyond the next visit Nov 2013
 - Monitoring Visit report April 2014
- ❖ Children's Service Performance Management – Quarterly Monitoring
- ❖ Schools results – September 2013
- ❖ Schools Annual Report 2012 / 2013
- ❖ Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales – Annual Review and Evaluation of Performance 2012 / 2013
- ❖ Child Health and Disability Service
- ❖ Adoption
- ❖ Advocacy

- ❖ Recruitment and Retention of Social Workers
- ❖ Integrated Family Support Team – Annual Report.

Call-in

- ❖ Additional Welsh Medium School Places to Service the Canton, Grangetown and Riverside Areas – 3 September 2013.

The Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee has held 12 full Committee meetings and one joint meeting with Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee since June 2013.

As a result of the consideration of over 50 reports covering policy development, pre-decision scrutiny, monitoring progress and service area performance, the Scrutiny Committee Chairperson wrote 27 letters to the Cabinet and officers, which included requests for additional information, comments, and observations, on items considered at the Committee Meetings. Also as a result of these meetings the Committee wrote to the relevant Cabinet Member identifying six specific recommendations for the Cabinet and officers to consider.

The Committee received timely responses from the Cabinet to all letters that requested a response. In addition officers have provided additional information where requested and agreed to amend future reports in response to the Committee's requests.

Members of the Committee have also participated in a number of cross cutting short Task and Finish Group inquiries along with Members from other Scrutiny Committees. These included:

- ❖ Local Development Plan – Deposit Plan
- ❖ Tackling Human Trafficking in Cardiff
- ❖ Community Hubs
- ❖ Cardiff Partnership Board – Scrutiny Panel.

Inspection and Assessment of Committee

The work of the Committee has been assessed by her Majesty's Inspectorate for Education and Training in Wales (Estyn), Wales Audit Office, the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales (CSSIW) and the Council Commissioned Peer Review. The assessments have been undertaken through attendance as observers at Committee meetings, review of reports, minutes and letter, together with interviews with Councillor Lent, the Chairman of the Committee.

The outcome from each of the assessments was to acknowledge the Committee's key role in holding the Executive to account, aiding in the pre-decision scrutiny of policy development and to help challenge and monitor the performance of the services provided for Children and Young People in Cardiff.

Member Development

As Scrutiny is a Member-led function, and its success is closely linked to the capacity and capabilities of the Members who sit on Scrutiny Committees, the Scrutiny Team worked closely with colleagues across the Council to provide a continuous range of opportunities for Members to build or refresh their Scrutiny skills, and extend their knowledge and insight into a range of issues relevant to their Scrutiny role.

All Members of the Committee actively participated in the training sessions and have attended briefings, awareness raising sessions, and undertaken reflection sessions to help improve the impact of the Committee meetings. Most recently the Committee has agreed to develop a programme of school performance and analysis training to further support the Council in improving the educational outcomes for its pupils.

The Scrutiny development and training programme is an on going process and further opportunities will be identified to help Members in fulfilling the full span of their duties as an elected representative and community champion.

Highlights from the Committee's Work Programme

This section of the Annual Report presents highlights of the Committee's activities during 2013-14 and where possible identifies the impact that the Committee has made through its work over the year.

The Provision of Services and Support by the Child Health and Disability Team

At its meeting on 19th February 2013 the Committee considered a briefing paper on an audit of child health and disability cases undertaken in September 2012. The audit revealed concerns about some children whilst in their parents' care. Action was taken to safeguard children with the assistance of Intake and Assessment. As a result of these concerns, all open cases were audited during November and December 2012, identifying poor compliance with recording media, with both electronic and paper records often significantly out of date.

Following consideration of the issues identified in the briefing paper as well as concerns from parents around access to services and problems in the social work team, Committee agreed to undertake a short task & finish Inquiry Child Health and Disability was followed. The inquiry was focused on looking at models of good practice in the provision of support and services to children with severe health and disability issues. The Task Group agreed to hold 5 meetings receiving evidence from staff, Children's Services managers, voluntary organisations, users and visits to best practice authorities.

The Committee's report of this Inquiry was presented to the Cabinet on 9 December 2013. A revised Disability Strategy was considered by the Committee in May 2014, addressing the recommendations contained in the report.

Impact of Poverty on Educational Attainment

The Committee undertook an inquiry into 'Educational Attainment and Poverty in Cardiff' during 2013. The aim of this inquiry was for Members to develop a comprehensive understanding of the issues faced by young people living in poverty, specifically in relation to their educational attainment. The inquiry looked at the attainment gap between Free School Meal (FSM) pupils and non-FSM pupils in Cardiff, the role poverty and deprivation play in this, and initiatives that can help to reduce this attainment gap.

In undertaking this inquiry the Members held 10 meetings, receiving evidence from 19 witnesses. This included meeting with Welsh Government officers, charities, Council officers, University academics, consultants and young people.

Members of the inquiry visited five primary schools and five secondary schools in Cardiff and undertook a visit to Swansea to visit a primary school and meet with the Chief Executive, Cabinet Members and senior officers. Research was commissioned with the Scrutiny Research Team and Cardiff Youth Council where a team of young people undertook peer to peer interviews and presented their findings to the inquiry. In addition a number of policy documents were been considered.

The final report of this Inquiry was presented to Cabinet in July 2013 and a formal response is to be presented to Committee in the near future.

Looked After Children's Transition to Independent Living

The Committee during its consideration of its work programme identified as its second Task & Finish Group inquiry the provision of services and support for Looked After Children in their transition to independent living. The Inquiry has already held a number of meetings, including a briefing from Children's Services managers, a visit to the Leaving Care Team, a briefing from a Welsh Government Assembly Member and evidence from the South Wales Police and Crime Commissioner. The Task Group has also undertaken a "Call for

Evidence” exercise with 22 third sector organisations who support and advise Looked After Children in their transition to independent living.

The Inquiry has also received evidence from Scrutiny Research together with a visit to a best practice authority and feedback from a group of Looked After Children who had moved to independent living.

A number of third sector organisations were keen to ensure that their comments and concerns were heard by the Task Group. The final report of this Inquiry will be considered by Committee in the summer of 2014.

Looked After Children – Listening Event

The Committee agreed as part of its work programme for this municipal year to develop a process to enable young people to have their views heard, and for those views to be heard by decision makers at a strategic, policy and / or operations level across the Council.

The Committee considered that a key priority was to hear from children aged 11 and under, who were Looked After, about their view of the care and support they received from the Council. The event was facilitated by the Tros Gynnal Plant Advocacy Service, designed by a small team of Looked After Children, and held in County Hall.

An invitation leaflet was issued to all Looked After Children. Social workers and foster carers were informed of the event, and asked to support Looked After Children to attend. A number of young people attended the event, ranging in age from 6 to 11 year of age, and provided Members with their views, concerns and advice on improving services for Looked After Children. The event also enabled the young people to identify what they felt was currently working, so that this could be identified as best practice.

Children felt that their views were being heard by people in the Council who could influence decision makers with their concerns and advice. The

outcome from the event was captured in a report for the Committee and Cabinet and will be presented to Cabinet in the near future.

Corporate Parenting

The Inquiry arose from concerns expressed by Members of the Corporate Parenting Panel that the Panel does not have a statutory role or status, but was adopted as a good practice mechanism to support the Council to fulfil its responsibilities as corporate parent to all children in care or leaving care in Cardiff. The Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee also agreed at its meeting on 14 January 2014 to consider undertaking a review of the Terms of Reference of the Council's Corporate Parenting Panel.

It was further agreed by the Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee that the inquiry should be undertaken jointly with members of the Corporate Parenting Panel. The Committee agreed that the inquiry could give consideration to formalising the status of the Panel as a committee of the Cabinet; to widen the remit of the Panel to include 'Children in Need'; to adopt a structured annual cycle of reporting; to extend the business of the Panel to include consideration of Child Practice Reviews and to incorporate into the Work Programme of the Panel / Board a structured regular pattern of Member visits to frontline teams.

The joint Corporate Parenting Panel and Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee Task and Finish Group agreed to hold one evidence gathering meeting on 20th March 2014. The Group members received, prior to their meeting, back ground information, advice, guidance and best practice information. In addition advice and comments, on the review of the role and status of the Corporate Parenting in the Council, was received from Tony Young, Director of Children's Services, Angela Bourge, Operational Manager Resources and Debbie Martin-Jones, Operational Manager LAC Services. A number of partner organisations were invited to attend or provide written advice, however only the National Children Bureau provided advice.

The Committee's report recommending the role and status of Corporate Parenting to be reflected through an advisory Committee of Council to the Cabinet, is due to be presented to Cabinet, Constitution Committee and Council in the summer of 2014.

Tackling Human Trafficking in Cardiff

The Committee is also undertaking a Joint inquiry with the Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee into Tackling Human Trafficking in Cardiff. This inquiry which covers the trafficking of Adults and Children, resulted from a debate at Council. During a series of evidence gathering meetings Members have heard from local agencies, the Police and the Crown Prosecution Services, and third sector agencies. Members have also met with council officers and Cabinet Members covering social services, education and housing services. The inquiry is currently considering their key findings and recommendations and due to finalise its report in the near future.

Engagement with Young People

The Committee continued its commitment to regularly engage with children and young people while developing its work programme, seeking views on certain issues and helping secure children and young people's engagement in the governance arrangements of the Council. The Committee ensured that members of the Youth Council are fully aware of the Council's scrutiny arrangements, together with an understanding of the influences that the Committee can have on policy development and operational organisation.

Children and Young People have been involved in providing advice to all of the Committee's Task and Finish inquiries and have presented their comments and advice at five public Committee meetings.

Representatives of the Cardiff Youth Council (CYC) requested to attend Committee to present their comments, concerns and proposals on the Council's forthcoming budget, which it was anticipated would involve considerable

reductions in funding. They explained that they were aware that discussions were currently taking place regarding budget setting for the next financial year. They were also aware of the austerity measures that the government is enforcing and the potential implications this has for communities all over the country.

Youth Support Services provide young people with access to staff and opportunities required for young people to make good decisions in their lives. For thousands of young people, youth workers are the main trusted adults in their lives outside of their families, for many they are the only trusted adult.

Youth Support workers in areas such as Play, Youth Justice, Mental Health, Sports Development, Youth Work and Art Development all make a key contribution to this city's vision for young people under the Young Persons Version of the "What Matters" Strategy that CYC launched at City Hall in March 2011. Youth Support Staff set young people on a path to success, representing real value for money, which is important in these difficult times.

The CYC recognised the need for some difficult decisions to be made in relation to funding and budgets but are asking the people making these decisions to:

1. Consider the value and outcomes of the work carried out by Youth Support Services to both young people and the wider community.
2. Clarify the current situation with regards to potential budgets to Youth Support Services in Cardiff.
3. To engage in meaningful dialogue with the children and young people of Cardiff around their needs and the services they require.
4. Ensure any changes to services to young people should be fair and equitable with no group hit more than any other in society.
5. Ensure that youth support services are well coordinated and supported in the future.

The Committee has also ensured that young people's views have been used to advise the Task & Finish Inquiry into Corporate Parenting, and the task group Inquiry into Looked After Children's Transition to Independent Living.

The Committee's engagement with Young People "Give young people a voice! Engaging young people in Cardiff scrutiny" has been shortlisted for this year's National Centre for Public Scrutiny Awards for: "**Involvement, Insight and Impact**". The award ceremony will take place on 10 June in London.

The Youth Council is able to fully engage with the Committee and understands the influence that it can have in the governance of the Council and decisions being made by Officers and Cabinet.

Merger of Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Safeguarding Children's Boards

The Deputy Minister for Children and Social Services announced that the Social Services (Wales) Bill would include provision to move the current configuration of LSCBs on a local authority footprint to a regional grouping based upon the Public Service Delivery Model, and that this was to be taken forward in advance of the legislation being put in place. The Deputy Minister expressed an expectation that LSCBs would begin planning for the change as soon as possible. The Deputy Minister continued to urge all LSCBs to make progress towards a regional model, ensuring that all the risks have been properly assessed and discharged in anticipation of the legislation.

The LSCBs in Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan have been examining the potential for closer collaboration including a merger, to form a single regional Board. Similar developments are taking place elsewhere in Wales. The Cwm Taff LSCB includes the Rhondda Cynon Taff and Merthyr areas, and the LSCBs in Neath Port Talbot, Bridgend and Swansea are planning to merge in 2013.

A number of benefits have been identified that could be achieved by merging the LSCBs, and both the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Boards currently have a similar structure which includes standing sub-groups and use of task and finish groups as recommended by statutory guidance. The Boards have successfully operated a Joint Training Sub-group for some years. They have

also shared the development of some policies and procedures. There are, however, a number of challenges and detailed agreement would be needed

Both Boards have agreed in principle to merge. An Executive Board has been established to drive forward the merger. The Business Planning Group has also merged and is driving forward the strategic work of both LSCBs. Work is ongoing to recruit staff to support the merged Board. The two LSCBs have agreed to consider the possibility of appointing an independent chair in the future in line with the Social Services Bill to the proposed joint Board, as is current practice in England.

The Committee agreed to continue to review the plans for the merger.

Recruitment and Retention of Social Workers

The Committee has regularly expressed its concerns at the high levels of vacancies in Children's Services, in particular its influence on the performance of Children's Services. The newly appointed Cabinet Member and Director of Children's Services informed the Committee of their commitment to focus on the improvement in the recruitment and retention of social workers.

The Committee received a briefing on the work in progress to develop a strategy for the recruitment and retention of social workers in Cardiff. In addition management has been acting to replace agency staff with permanent employees and particularly to terminate high cost manager appointments by offering the opportunity to existing managers to take on additional responsibilities. The result of these recent temporary measures has been successful and has shown that there are talented individuals within the service who should be encouraged to seek promotion.

The Members received regular progress reports on the progress being made to address the high level of agency staff being used and the implementation of the strategy to enhance the recruitment and retention of social workers in Children's Services.

The Committee agreed to continue to monitor the implementation of the strategy.

Social Impact Bonds

The Committee was given the opportunity to review proposals to consider commissioning a feasibility study for a Social Impact Bond (SIB).

SIBs are a way of attracting external investment into public services in certain circumstances. An investor in a SIB will fund an evidence-based intervention with the anticipation that in the event that the intervention is successful, they will receive a return on their investment paid for by a service commissioner (i.e. the Council).

The feasibility scheme in question is around helping to prevent the need for an external residential placement for a Looked After Child (LAC) where their care plan supports a return to Cardiff. The feasibility study will be undertaken by an organisation experienced in children's social care and will focus on LAC who present with such significantly challenging and risk-taking behaviour that their placement stability is considered threatened.

The Committee welcomed the opportunity to be briefed on the outcome of the feasibility study before it was considered by Cabinet.

In respect of the introduction of the Social Impact Bond proposal, the Committee had various comments which they felt should be considered prior to its implementation.

The Cabinet Member responded positively to the Committee's comments and agreed to present a further report prior to the implementation of the social impact bonds.

2013-14 Budget Proposals

The Council's Constitution allows for Scrutiny's consideration of options generated for Full Council in setting its annual budget. At its February 2014 meeting the Committee considered the Council's draft Corporate Plan and draft budgetary proposals for 2014 - 15, included their detailed savings proposals and Capital Programme. The meeting was attended by the relevant Cabinet Members and Directors, who each made a presentation on their areas of responsibility.

Children's Library Service - The Committee reviewed a proposal to merge the Children's Librarian post with the Welsh Librarian post. This issue remained unresolved at the meeting as proposals would be published for consultation. The Committee held a further two meetings to clarify the final proposal and following detailed questioning requested that following the implementation of the merger and further report would be provided identifying the impact of the merger on the service.

Education Budget Proposals - The Committee noted that the Education Budget had been increased by 0.9% in line with the Welsh Government's commitment and had now delegated over 85% of the budget to schools.

The Committee noted that the Cabinet Member and Officers indicated that they were actively investigating alternative delivery methods for the provision of Youth Services across Cardiff. However, Members expressed their concern that the alternative delivery options would not be in place at the start of the year, thereby ensuring continuation of the service. Members therefore recommended that Cabinet postpone the implementation of the saving proposals for the Youth Service until alternative provisions were put in place, ensuring the continuation of the service and support for children and young people.

Members were concerned that the County Hall Nursery was identified for closure and expressed concern that the proposed closure date of August 2014 only serves as a threat to existing parents and a deterrent to potential parents.

Members therefore agreed to recommend that the closure date be moved to the end of the financial year.

Children's Services Budget Proposals - Members welcomed that Children's Services proposed budget had been realigned by £2.738M to bring the budget in line with actual expenditure and that there had been protection for front line services.

The Committee considered that there was one key issue within the budget proposals that was of extreme concern, namely the impact of the "Work Force Agreement" on the workload, and the recruitment and retention of Social Workers in Children's Services. The Committee recommended that the Cabinet must ensure that Cardiff continues paying Social Workers at least as much as those in neighbouring authorities and that case loads, which are acknowledged to be very high, are amended to reflect the reduction in the working week.

Play Service - The Committee was extremely concerned to hear that there was a proposal to reduce the Play Service budget from £1,271M to £251,000 and move to a commissioning model of provision. Committee expressed their extreme concern that plans for the introduction of alternative methods of provision had not been developed and would not be in place to ensure the continuation of the service beyond the 31 March 2014. As a result the Committee recommended that funding for each centre be continued until alternative funding mechanisms have been fully investigated.

The Committee's comments on the budget proposals were considered by the Cabinet. Cabinet reviewed the funding arrangements for Children's Play, Youth Service and County Hall Nursery and agreed to provide additional funding for 2014/15, to enable alternative funding mechanisms to be investigated over the following year.

ESTYN Inspection Report

A Welsh Government's ESTYN inspection of Educational Services in Cardiff took place in the summer of 2011, to help form a judgment on the local education authority's performance. An additional follow up monitoring visit was undertaken in February 2014, which recognised that progress had been made, but that there was still more that the local authority needed to do. The Committee had previously been monitoring the services areas progress in improving educational attainment and had been briefed on the new Directors strategy for educational improvement .in November 2013.

In April 2014 the Committee received a briefing from the Director of Education on the Estyn Inspection monitoring revisit letter, which identified six new recommendations for the Council to address. The Committee noted that an Action Plan was being developed and would be submitted as soon as possible.

The Committee agreed to closely monitor the implementation of the action plan as well as committing to the implementation of the four actions identified for Scrutiny to implement:

- Ensure that the Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee receive clear, accurate and up to date information, together with improved quality analysis in all school performance reports;
- Develop and agree a clear protocol on the roles and responsibilities of the Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee and the Cardiff Partnership Board Scrutiny Panel in respect of the performance of education service;
- Develop a formal programme of training to be delivered, covering education performance, analysis, and assessment, for Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee Members; and
- Establish a programme to scrutinise the Education Directorate's delivery of its Monitoring Revisit Action Plan which addresses Estyn's

recommendations and which will improve educational performance in Cardiff schools.

The Committee also agreed to undertake a programme of performance assessment training to enable the Members to monitor, assess and challenge progress being made by all partners in improving the educational attainment of Cardiff's pupils.

The Cabinet Member responded positively to all the Committee's letters and agreed that officers would be pleased to present regular progress reports on the Action Plan to the Committee.

Quarterly Performance Reports – Children's Services

The Committee confirmed its desire to continue to monitor, on a quarterly basis, performance reports from Children's Services. The Members have been concerned that performance should, over time, meet agreed local targets and wherever possible meet nationally set targets. The Committee has therefore regularly challenged performance, targets and action plans.

In March 2014 the Committee wrote noting that the quarter three performance report highlighted a number of key improvements, particularly the achievement of 100% in the timeliness of reviews of children on the child protection register, as well as the increase in care plans for children at the start of being looked after, both of which are significant improvement. Members did however express their concern around the deterioration in a number of indicators which had also been emphasised in the report. Members recognised that management actions had been put in place to address these areas but were concerned that some actions, which involved moving staff from case management teams, could impact on work load as well as performance in other areas. The Committee looks forward to receiving a further improvement in the overall performance of the service in the quarter four report, later in the year.

The Cabinet Member responded positively to the Committee letters, providing all requested information and reflecting on all the Committee's comments, concerns and recommendations.

CALL-IN

The Council's Call-In Procedure provides that any non-Executive Member may call-in a decision of which notice has been given. Such notice must be given in writing to the Operational Manager (Scrutiny Services), who is required to notify the Cabinet Business Office and call a meeting of the relevant Committee, where possible after consultation with the Chairperson of the Committee, and in any case within seven clear working days of the decision to call-in.

SCHOOL ORGANISATION PLANNING: ADDITIONAL WELSH-MEDIUM PRIMARY SCHOOL PLACES TO SERVE THE CANTON, GRANGETOWN AND RIVERSIDE AREAS

The Committee at a special meeting on 3 September 2013 considered the Call-in of Cabinet Decision: CAB/13/0020, made by the Cabinet on 22 July 2013 published on 24 July 2013 with an implementation date of 5 August 2013. A Member requested that the above decisions be called-in for Scrutiny Committee consideration. The stated criteria for this request were:

- 1) "The decision taken to consult making permanent the temporary enlargement of Pwll Coch was taken on the basis of a flawed report (details below), thereby leaving the Council open to legal challenge.
- 2) "The decision work on solutions responding to demand for English Medium in the Fitzalan catchment area was taken on the basis of a flawed report (see details below), thereby leaving the Council open to legal challenge.
- 3) "The decision to consult on both aspects of the report should have included the option to consult on catering for Welsh medium education on the site identified at paragraph no. 45 of the report.

- 4) “The decision to continue to work on solutions for demand in English Medium Education should have specifically included changing catchment areas.
- 5) “The decision taken to consult on catering for demand for WME in Grangetown by permanently enlarging Pwll Coch is not in line with the established policy of catering for demand within communities (Welsh Government Welsh-medium Education Strategy, April 2010).
- 6) “The decisions taken leave the Council open to charges of maladministration and Scrutiny needs to ensure that decisions taken are defensible in a legal sense: we owe this to Cardiff Council Tax payers.
- 7) “The re-submission of a bid for SOP and the possible re-submission of the whole SOP, which is the natural conclusion of the decisions taken by the Cabinet does not represent an efficient use of a Council's resources.”

The Committee received evidence from the Cabinet Member for Education and Lifelong Learning and the Director of Education and Lifelong Learning. The Committee was informed by the Cabinet Member that she would give an undertaking to take a further report to Cabinet detailing new proposals. Following further discussions around your offer to bring new proposals for consultation a member of the Committee proposed that the Call-in be referred back to Cabinet and no further evidence be taken at this stage. This proposal was seconded and approved by Committee.

The Committee further agreed to write expressing their concern around a number of issues which members considered must be taken into account in the drafting of any new proposals that would be consulted on. The Committee therefore recommended that the Cabinet must:

- Take a urgent report to Cabinet rescinding Cabinet decision CAB/13/0020;

- Review the terms of reference, and ensure that all options can be explored to meet the demand for Welsh and English provision in all four Wards (Grangetown, Canton, Riverside and Butetown);
- Ensure that any consultation includes all four wards (Grangetown, Canton, Riverside and Butetown);
- Ensure that the consultation questions should be appropriate, clear and concise;
- Ensure that the draft Cabinet report must include details of the methodology used to project the pupils numbers that underpin the proposals; and
- Ensure that the new proposals, consultation and school improvements are progressed as soon as possible to enable the parents and children in these four wards to access high quality local schools at the earliest opportunity.

The Committee also noted the Cabinet Member's commitment to present the draft Cabinet report setting out the new proposals to this Committee as a pre-decision scrutiny. The Members welcomed this undertaking and agreed that, should it be necessary, the Committee would hold a special meeting to consider the draft cabinet report and extend an invitation to those who presented information to the Call-in meeting.

Suggested Items for 2014/15 Work Programme

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items, received from members of the public, young people, organisations, Council Members and other Scrutiny Committees, for inclusion on the work programme. Committee Members can also suggest any new issues which may be of interest to the Committee. The Committee will be starting the development of its work programme in June 2014.

Strategies and Policies

The Council is responsible for co-ordinating the production of the main strategies and plans covering service development and provision across a range of services and agencies. The Committee's future work programme could include:

- ESTYN Action Plan
- Children's Services Improvement Plan
- Corporate Plan and Budget
- Youth Justice Plan
- Welsh Education Strategic Plan
- Integrated Family Support Team.

Scrutiny Inquiries

The Committee has undertaken a number of Task Group inquiries during the year and will be identifying further issues for consideration during June 2014. The Committee has however agreed its commitment to continue to hold further listening events with young people following the successful event this year.

Regular Updates

It is suggested that the Committee continues to receive the regular progress and performance reports on:

- Children's Services performance
- ESTYN Action Plan and school performance
- Budget proposals and monitoring
- Child Practice Reviews.

Increasing Partnership Scrutiny

Welsh Government has commissioned a range of studies in recent years (including the Beecham Review and the more recent Simpson Review) which have substantially advanced thinking on the role of collaboration in public service administration.

Cardiff was the first local authority in Wales to introduce scrutiny to its Local Service Board in 2009, and following the successful evaluation of its award-winning pilot Scrutiny Panel it has resourced a new Scrutiny Panel, which met for the first time in March 2012. The Panel will play an important role in scrutinising the effectiveness of the Cardiff Partnership Board, and in optimising the implementation of the 10 year "What Matters" strategy for advancing wellbeing across seven key outcomes for people living in, working in or visiting our city.

A growing number of new local and regional collaborative scrutiny arrangements are emerging, notably for Cardiff and Vale Partnership Board, and the emerging Consortia for Social Care.

Scrutiny Services, City of Cardiff Council,
Room 243, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk

© 2014 City of Cardiff Council

s c r u t i n y



A Report of: Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee

Annual Report 2013 – 2014

June 2014



The City of Cardiff Council

COMMUNITY & ADULT SERVICES SCRUTINY

COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP¹

(Chairperson)



[Councillor Ali Ahmed](#)



[Councillor David Groves](#)



[Councillor Joseph Carter](#)



[Councillor Eleanor Sanders](#)



[Councillor Mary McGarry](#)



[Councillor Eleanor Sanders](#)



[Councillor Graham Thomas](#)

¹ Councillor Ramesh Patel chaired the Committee from May 2013 – July 2013, when he took up a position in Cabinet. Councillor Daniel De’Ath chaired the Committee from September 2013 – March 2014, when he took up a position in Cabinet. Councillor Eleanor Sanders was elected Chair for the April 2014 meeting. Councillor Groves was elected Chair from May 2014.

Terms of Reference of the Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee

To scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of community and adult services, including:

- Public and Private Housing
- Disabled Facilities Grants
- Community Safety
- Neighbourhood Renewal and Communities Next
- Advice & Benefit
- Consumer Protection
- Older Persons Strategy
- Adult Social Care
- Community Care Services
- Mental Health & Physical Disabilities
- Commissioning Strategy
- Health Partnership
- Local Service Board

To assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Assembly Government, Assembly-sponsored public bodies and quasi-departmental non-governmental bodies and health services on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.

To report to an appropriate Executive or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures which may enhance the Authority's performance in this area.

To be the Council's Crime and Disorder Committee as required by the Police and Justice Act 2006 and any re-enactment or modification thereof; and as full delegate of the Council to exercise all the powers and functions permitted under that Act.

CHAIR'S FOREWORD

I would first of all like to sincerely thank Cllrs Patel, De'Ath and Sanders who have all kindly Chaired the Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee with great skill and aplomb before me, in this municipal year of 2013 to 2014. I would also like to sincerely thank all those who gave evidence to our committee this year; and all the members of the Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee for all of their diligent and hard work throughout the year.

To quote Christy Moore, the Irish singer-songwriter: "a busy year, this...". Our Annual Report outlines, details, amplifies and testifies to the fact that we have undertaken three inquiries; contributed to policy development by considering draft policy in at least seven theme areas; provided pre-decision scrutiny with reference to at least nine different policy areas; provided progress monitoring with regard to implementing previously agreed Council actions in two areas; provided performance monitoring in six theme areas and considered briefing papers in seven theme areas.

Over the year, this Scrutiny Committee has held fifteen meetings, and written twenty-four follow-up letters to Cabinet, Officers and to external partners, sharing our recommendations and concerns.

Members from Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee have also held two joint meetings with Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee to consider the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales Annual Review; and Annual Report in to the effectiveness of Social Care Services; and, along with members from Economy and Culture and Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committees, have held two meetings to consider the establishment of Citizen Hubs.

I, for one, (and I'm sure we all,) are ever mindful that little or none of our scrutiny work would be possible without the outstanding officer support which we receive. I would like then, in closing, to take this opportunity to warmly and sincerely thank all the staff in Scrutiny Services and Member Services for all of their exceptional and hard work for us throughout this and every year.



Councillor David Groves
Chair, Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee

OVERVIEW

The Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service and policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of housing, neighbourhood renewal and adult social care. The Committee is also the Council's crime and disorder scrutiny committee.

One of the main aims of this Committee is to look at things from a service user and citizen perspective and use this to inform our observations and recommendations to the Cabinet. Where possible, we have invited contributions to our work from carers, advocates, service users, citizens, partners and the third sector as well as hearing from Council Members and officers and statutory organisations.

Between June 2013 and May 2014 the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Inquiries** - Where the Committee has undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet:
 - The Impact of the Under Occupation of Social Housing (Bedroom Tax) Welfare Reform in Cardiff
 - Control of Dangerous Dogs in Cardiff (joint with Environmental Scrutiny Committee)
 - Tackling Human Trafficking in Cardiff.
- **Policy Development and/or Review** - Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes by considering draft policy documents and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required:
 - Integrating Health and Social Care Programme
 - Fairer Deal for Adult Social Care Users and Social Care Workforce
 - Health and Social Care: Mobile Working and Scheduling
 - Standards in Residential and Nursing Care Homes
 - The use of CCTV to tackle crime and disorder
 - Local Housing Strategy Update
 - Supported Living Services for Adults with Learning Disabilities.

- **Pre decision** - Where the Committee has evaluated and commented on policy proposals before they go to the Cabinet, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision:
 - Housing Partnership Project
 - Citizen Hubs
 - Building Communities
 - Housing Revenue Account Business Plan 2014-15
 - Supporting People Programme
 - Housing Allocations Policy
 - Older People Statement of Intent and Framework
 - Three Year Dementia Plan
 - Fairer Deal for Adult Social Care.

- **Monitoring Progress** - Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's progress in implementing actions previously agreed:
 - 'Provision of Accommodation for Gypsy and Traveller Households in Cardiff' – Implementation of Agreed Recommendations
 - 'Meeting Affordable Housing Needs in Cardiff' – Implementation of Agreed Recommendations

- **Monitoring Performance** - Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance:
 - Corporate Plan and Budget
 - Quarterly Performance Reports – Adult Services
 - Six Monthly Performance Reports - Communities and Community Safety
 - Protection of Vulnerable Adults – Draft Area Adult Protection Committee Annual Report 2012-13
 - CSSIW Evaluation of Social Services in Cardiff 2012-13
 - Health Inspectorate Wales – Report on Mr. K.

- **Briefing Papers**
 - Regional Collaboration re Regulatory Services
 - Hafod Care Homes
 - Community Maintenance Services
 - Affordable Warmth Strategy
 - Solar Panel Strategy
 - Housing (Wales) Bill
 - CPB Scrutiny Panel Update Reports.

Over the year the Scrutiny Committee held 15 committee meetings and wrote 24 letters to the Cabinet, officers and external partners, sharing their comments/ recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. This included two joint meetings with the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee, in order to consider the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales Annual Review and the Annual Report on the Effectiveness of Social Care Services 2011-12.

Members from this Committee also formed a sub-committee which, along with sub-committees from the Economy and Culture and Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committees, held 2 meetings to scrutinise proposals to establish citizen hubs in Ely/Caerau, Splott & Tremorfa, Grangetown and Pentwyn.

Finally, Members from this Committee participated in the following scrutiny inquiry, which had representatives from all the scrutiny committees:

- Local Development Plan 2006-26 – Draft Deposit Plan.

INQUIRIES

Bedroom Tax in Cardiff

This report concentrated on the impact of the size criteria introduced by the Welfare Reforms for social housing tenants, more commonly known as the Bedroom Tax. In Cardiff, at the time that this changed was introduced, at least four thousand social housing tenants, and their households, were affected. Members wanted to make sure that plans to assist these tenants, and to mitigate the impact, were working and to see whether there was more that could be done.

To inform the Inquiry, we heard from a range of witnesses, including tenant representatives, Cardiff Against the Bedroom Tax, housing associations and the Cardiff & Vale Citizen Advice Bureau as well as council officers and the Cabinet Member. Research was undertaken to review the different approaches taken by other local authorities to managing the impact of the Bedroom Tax.

Our findings showed that the work underway in Cardiff is assisting those affected. Work in this area is developing fast and it was heartening that council staff were keeping up to speed with changes. Given that two thirds of those affected are disabled, several of our recommendations aim to improve assistance to these tenants. The report also highlights the very real need for community based internet access in Cardiff to cope with the planned roll-out of Universal Credit in the future.

The report was presented to the Cabinet at its meeting on 21st February 2014. A response to the recommendations is expected in June 2014.

Control of Dangerous Dogs

Members from this Committee have undertaken a joint Inquiry with the Environmental Scrutiny Committee to review the control of dangerous dogs in Cardiff. The agreed terms of reference for the inquiry were to review the potential impact that the 'Anti-Social

Behaviour Crime & Policing Bill' would have on managing dangerous dogs in Cardiff and the implications this will have for Cardiff Council.

In doing this the inquiry Members heard from Councillor Dilwar Ali, Elected Member for Llandaff North, as well as Julie Morgan AM, Assembly Member, Cardiff North both of whom are active campaigners regarding the need for effective dog controls. Members also heard from South Wales Police, Guide Dogs Cymru, Cardiff University, University of South Wales, Cardiff Canine Citizens, Communication Workers Union, Royal Mail and RSPCA Cymru, as well as council officers and Cabinet Members.

The recommendations not only focused on the Cabinet promoting responsible dog ownership in Cardiff but on the Cabinet lobbying the Welsh Government and Home Office to enable more effective control of dangerous dogs.

The report was presented to the Cabinet at its meeting on 21st February 2014. A response to the recommendations is expected in June 2014.

Tackling Human Trafficking in Cardiff

Members from this Committee are undertaking a joint Inquiry with the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee to look at the work underway in Cardiff to tackle human trafficking and to make recommendations to improve the way that human trafficking in Cardiff is tackled.

Members have heard from local agencies involved in work to tackle human trafficking as well as from organisations that work across Wales, including statutory bodies, such as the Police and the Crown Prosecution Services, and third sector agencies such as Barnardos, Safer Wales and BAWSO. Members have met with council officers and Cabinet Members covering social services, education and housing services and have received written evidence from Commissioning and Procurement.

Members are currently considering their key findings and recommendations and the report is due to be brought to Committee for amendment and approval shortly.

POLICY DEVELOPMENT

Members have undertaken a significant amount of policy development work in respect of Health and Social Care, as well as policy development scrutiny in respect of the use of CCTV to tackle crime and disorder and the updating of the Local Housing Strategy. Details of some of these are provided below.

Commissioning and Procuring Domiciliary Care in Cardiff

Throughout 2012-13 and 2013-14 this Committee has undertaken regular scrutinies of the work of the task force set up to look at establishing a fairer deal for Adult Social Care service users and workforce. In 2013-14 this has included receiving progress reports on the task force work, reviewing the Expert Group's report and carrying out pre-decision scrutiny of a report to Cabinet, which is detailed in the next section.

This Committee remains supportive of the aspirations of the Task Force. Our review of the Expert Group report found that, whilst the report did not provide enough evidence to substantiate the conclusions drawn and the recommendations made nor clarity about how the recommendations will lead to the improvements sought by the Task Force, the answers provided at the meeting did contain more detail. We therefore recommended that the subsequent Cabinet report ensure that it contained evidence-based recommendations and recommended that there was further engagement with the Task Force members before the report was taken to Cabinet.

Standards in residential and nursing care homes

Members undertook this scrutiny to examine the processes in place within the Council and with partners, such as the CSSIW and Health Board, to monitor and evaluate standards and to address concerns and safeguarding issues.

Members were reassured by the evidence they heard from officers and partners about the processes in place and were pleased to hear recognition of the need to continually improve these processes. Members heard that plans were in place to deliver improved information for the public and that the current commissioning process is under review with the aim of moving towards an outcomes-focused strategic commissioning framework. Members asked to receive details of the number and type of complaints received by the Council; the service area supplied this information.

The use of CCTV to tackle Crime and Disorder

At the request of another Member, this Committee agreed to prioritise scrutinising the current use of CCTV to tackle crime and disorder issues in Cardiff. As part of this, we heard from a number of council service areas, including information management, housing, telematics and waste enforcement. Members welcomed the work in hand to: comply with codes of practice governing the use of CCTV; develop an Alarm Receiving Centre and Virtual Concierge Scheme; and purchase additional mobile CCTV units to be used by the anti-social behaviour team. These steps should help to support vulnerable citizens and promote community well-being.

PRE – DECISION SCRUTINY

Members have carried out pre-decision scrutiny on a number of housing and community items as well as some health and social care reports, including: Housing Partnership Project; Citizen Hubs; Building Communities White Paper; Housing Revenue Account Business Plan 2014-15 and Welsh Housing Quality Standards; Supporting People Programme; Housing Allocations Policy; Fairer Deal for Adult Social Care; Older People Statement of Intent and Framework; and Three Year Dementia Plan. Members also scrutinised the relevant sections of the draft Corporate Plan 2014-15 and Budgetary Proposals 2014-15.

Building Communities White Paper

Overall, Members welcomed the Building Communities White Paper and the proposed direction for future neighbourhood working. Members recommended that guidance be developed for the role of elected Members in neighbourhood working and on the role of the Lead Member. Members recommended thought be given to whether deputy lead members would be needed and to how to ensure political balance. Members also recommended that thought be given to re-launch neighbourhood management to raise awareness amongst the general public. These recommendations were accepted and acted on, leading to role profiles, clarification that the Local Government Code of Conduct for Members would apply and a proposed re-launch once Lead Members were in post.

Draft Housing Allocations Policy

Members built on previous policy development scrutiny by undertaking pre-decision scrutiny of proposed changes to the way in which council housing is allocated in Cardiff. Members recognised the need for change and were pleased to see that the proposals were based on extensive consultation, including tenants and housing applicants. Members recommended that effective indicators be put in place to monitor the impact of the new policy, to see whether the aims are reflected in the implementation or whether there are unintended consequences. This recommendation was accepted, with the Cabinet Member stating that robust monitoring will take place to ensure that practice reflects the intended policy.

Fairer Deal for Adult Social Care

Members held a special committee meeting on 12th March 2014 to scrutinise the report to Cabinet on this topic. Members re-iterated their support for a step-change in domiciliary care provision and welcomed the commitment that the future commissioning model would build on the recommendations of the Expert Group report, which had been scrutinised as part of our policy development work. In order to avoid any uncertainty or doubt in the future as to this commitment, Members recommended amendments be made to the Cabinet Report recommendations. The Cabinet Member agreed to these amendments and at the Cabinet Meeting on 13th March 2014 the amended recommendations were accepted.

Corporate Plan & Budget

At its February 2014 meeting the Committee considered the Council's draft Corporate Plan and draft budgetary proposals for 2014 – 15. Members noted with concern that the proposed increase in the charge for Meals on Wheels may result in people eating less healthily; the proposed increase in cost was reduced by half in the final budget. Members also sought clarification about how much money was being transferred to the Neighbourhood Partnerships and how this money would be distributed.

Members stated their intention to recommend to a future Committee that it monitor the delivery of proposed savings and to look at the scrutiny of proposals regarding joining up work to respond to 'out of hours' calls regarding noise nuisance..

MONITORING PROGRESS

Members received progress reports on the implementation of agreed recommendations for two previous Inquiries: 'Provision of Accommodation for Gypsy and Traveller Households in Cardiff'; and 'Meeting Affordable Housing Needs in Cardiff'.

Members also received the Cabinet Response to a previous Inquiry 'A Review of Multi-Agency Approaches To Tackling Sex Work/ Prostitution', which was submitted to the previous Administration in April 2012. Following the local elections and change in administration, the Cabinet agreed their response to the recommendations at their meeting on 23rd September 2013. The Cabinet Response states that '*The work of the Task & Finish Group has been invaluable in informing the development of the multi agency approach to tackling sex work and prostitution.*'² Twelve out of thirteen recommendations were accepted and the response detailed the actions taken to date and planned.

MONITORING PERFORMANCE

Members have received regular performance reports for adult social care, community safety and housing services. This year, the performance report structure for adult social care services was refined to further improve the flow and format of the report and enable Members to clearly see the contribution to meeting corporate objectives.

Members have also received reports from relevant Inspectors, including the Care and Social Services Inspectorate for Wales and Healthcare Inspectorate Wales. This Committee has held joint meetings with the Children and Young People Scrutiny Committee to scrutinise the Director of Social Services Annual Report and to receive the CSSIW Evaluation of Social Services in Cardiff 2012-13 report.

Finally, Members have received the draft Area Adult Protection Committee Annual Report 2012-13, which details work by the Council and Health Board in respect of the Protection of Vulnerable Adults.

² Cabinet Papers - 23rd September 2013 - Cabinet Response To The Report Of Community And Adult Services Scrutiny Committee Entitled 'A Review Of Multi-Agency Approaches To Tackling Sex Work/Prostitution'

WORK PROGRAMME FOR 2014 - 15

Members of the Committee will soon be invited to consider items for possible inclusion in the Committee's work programme during 2014-15. Work is currently in progress to draw together issues for the new Committee to consider. A draft work programme will then be developed and brought to Committee for approval and implementation. The Committee would welcome suggestions for scrutiny items from other Members.

FUTURE SCRUTINY WORK

Over the course of its deliberations this year, the Committee has recommended that the following items be considered for inclusion in the Committee's 2014-15 work programme:

- ❖ Housing Partnerships Project
- ❖ Regional Regulatory Collaboration
- ❖ Dumballs Road Regeneration
- ❖ Supporting People Local Commissioning Plan 2015-16
- ❖ Impact of HRA Subsidy Changes
- ❖ Noise Nuisance joint working
- ❖ Intermediate Care Fund 'Gateway Project' progress
- ❖ Homelessness – use of private rented sector
- ❖ Domestic Violence – recommissioning of services
- ❖ Social Services & Well Being (Wales) Act
- ❖ Integrating Health and Social Care
- ❖ Supported Living Services Commissioning
- ❖ Older Peoples Services Commissioning
- ❖ Residential and Nursing Care Home Commissioning
- ❖ Domiciliary Care Models and Commissioning
- ❖ Review of Assessment and Care Management
- ❖ Meals on Wheels Review
- ❖ Performance Reports
- ❖ Savings Reports
- ❖ Cabinet Responses to previous Inquiries
- ❖ Implementation of agreed recommendations from previous Inquiries.

Scrutiny Services, The City of Cardiff Council
Room 243, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk
© 2014 The City of Cardiff Council

scrutiny



A Report of:

**Economy & Culture
Scrutiny Committee**

Annual Report 2013-14

June 2014



City of Cardiff Council

CONTENTS

Committee Membership	3
Committee's Terms of Reference	4
Chair's Foreword	5
Introduction	6
In-depth Inquiries	9
Call-ins	20
Policy Development	21
Pre-Decision Scrutiny	23
Performance Monitoring	26
Recommendations for Future Work Programme	28
Appendix 1: List of Items Considered during the Municipal Year	30

ECONOMY & CULTURE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

MEMBERSHIP 2013 - 14



Cllr Craig Williams (Chairperson)



Cllr Dilwar Ali



Cllr Joe Boyle (to Oct 13)



Cllr Peter Bradbury
(to April 14)



Cllr Phil Hawkins
(to Oct 13)



Cllr Gareth Holden



Cllr Nigel Howells



Cllr Mohammad Javed



Cllr Georgina Phillips



Cllr Chris Weaver



Cllr Darren Williams
(from Jan 14)

COMMITTEE'S TERMS OF REFERENCE

This Committee is empowered under the Constitution of the City of Cardiff Council to:

Scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of economic regeneration.

The aspects of the Council's work that falls within this definition include:

- *Cardiff Business Council*
- *Inward Investment and the marketing of Cardiff*
- *South East Wales Economic Forum*
- *Economic Strategy and Employment*
- *European Funding and Investment*
- *Small to Medium Enterprise Support*
- *Cardiff Harbour Authority*
- *Lifelong Learning*
- *Leisure Centres*
- *Sports Development*
- *Parks and Green Spaces*
- *Libraries, Arts and Culture*
- *Civic Buildings*
- *Events and Tourism*
- *Strategic Projects*
- *Innovation and Technology Centres*
- *Local Training & Enterprise*

Committee is also empowered to:

assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies and quasi-departmental non governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.

And to:

report to an appropriate Cabinet or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures, which may enhance Council performance or service delivery in this area.

CHAIR'S FOREWORD

I am pleased to present the Committee's Annual Report for 2013 – 14, which shows Committee performing effectively during the second year of this Municipal Term. A talented group of Members has worked hard and co-operated well across political boundaries to focus on a range of important issues. We have enjoyed productive relationships with Cabinet Members and senior officers, developed useful links with professional and community-based organisations, and helped the Council to grapple with a number of pressing economic and organisational challenges.

We have work fully across the Committee's Terms of Reference, supporting scrutiny of items as diverse as the city's economic development; the preservation of Cardiff's leisure, commercial, cultural and heritage assets in difficult financial circumstances; major sporting events and community sports participation; and learning and employment prospects for our varied communities. In so doing, our work has been appreciated by a range of audiences, and praised by independent third parties such as the Federation of Small Business and Welsh Local Government Association¹.

During the year we have made a number of evidence based and practical recommendations for the Cabinet to consider. Many of these are contained in the Committee's four in-depth inquiry reports completed this year, and others have emerged from the 35 items considered in Committee's 12 public meetings.

I wish to use this opportunity to thank all Members of the Committee, officers and external stakeholders who've contributed to and supported our work this year.



Councillor Craig Williams
Chair of the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee
June 2014

¹ Page 16 below refers

INTRODUCTION

The Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing policy development across a range of Council services, including aspects three significant Council Directorates (Economic Development; Sport, Leisure and Culture; and Communities, Housing and Customer Services). During 2013 – 14 this involved working across several Cabinet Portfolio areas, notably those of Finance and Economic Development; Sport, Leisure and Culture; Community and Neighbourhood Regeneration and Social Justice; and Education and Lifelong Learning.

This report presents the Committee's primary activities during 2013 -14 and, wherever possible, identifies the impact of the Committee's work upon the areas within its remit.

In its 2012 – 13 Annual Report the Committee recommended that (amongst other priorities to be determined) the following items should be included for consideration on its 2013 – 14 work programme:

- Economic Regeneration
- Innovation
- Enterprise Zones
- Community Asset Transfer
- State Aid
- Regular reports on performance and the budget
- To complete the current Inquiry on Small Business
- To undertake an Inquiry on Central Market and Arcades.

Between May 2013 and May 2014, the Committee scrutinised a wide range of topics, as set out below, under the following headings:

- **In-depth Inquiries** – Where the Committee has undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet.

- Innovation in Higher Education
- Small Business
- Alternative Operating Models in Leisure and Cultural Venues
- Cardiff Market and Historic Arcades.

These items are covered in detail on pages 8 - 18 below.

- **Call in** – Where a Member invokes the Call-in procedure under the Council's constitution, to review a Cabinet decision prior to implementation. In 2013-14 there was one joint call-in, detailed on page 19 below.
- **Policy Development** – Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes by considering draft policy documents. As Committee undertook several individual items of policy development during the year, for reasons of brevity these items are covered in brief outline on pages 20 - 21 below. Any readers interested in finding out more are welcome to contact Scrutiny Services for further information.
- **Pre-Decision** – Where the Committee has evaluated and commented on policy proposals before they go to the Cabinet, providing the Cabinet with the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision. As Committee undertook several pieces of pre-Decision scrutiny during the year, for reasons of brevity these items are covered in brief outline on pages 22 - 24 below. Any readers interested in finding out more are welcome to contact Scrutiny Services for further information.
- **Performance Monitoring** – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance and progress in implementing actions previously agreed. As Committee undertook several individual pieces of performance monitoring during the year, for reasons of brevity these items are covered in brief outline on pages 25 - 26 below. Any readers interested in finding out more are welcome to contact Scrutiny Services for further information.

Arising from this work, the Scrutiny Committee published three in-depth reports and sent 27 letters to officers and the Cabinet sharing their comments, recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of the items at Committee meetings. The following pages highlight the Committee's activities during 2013 - 14 and identify the comments and recommendations made.

IN-DEPTH INQUIRIES

Innovation in Higher Education in Cardiff

Between September and November 2013 the employed the relatively rarely used format of “Short Scrutiny” Inquiry to investigate the links between academic and entrepreneurial innovation, the worlds of industry and venture finance, and the roles and appropriate interfaces of public bodies such as higher education institutions, local authorities and regional government in harnessing innovative ideas to benefit the economic development of the city region.

A short scrutiny is a hybrid of a traditional committee item and a task and finish inquiry. It is held during one or two public Committee meetings in front of the whole Committee and members of the public, but explores issues in greater depth and commissions additional research not normally possible during a single Committee meeting item.

The Inquiry was arranged *“to provide an overview of innovation in the context of higher education institutions and to identify the role the Council can play in supporting those HEIs for the benefit of the city as a whole.”*

The short scrutiny’s terms of reference were:

- *What is innovation and what role do Higher Education Establishments play?*
- *The benefits for Cardiff that can emerge from innovation supported by Higher Education Establishments*
- *The policy context surrounding innovation in Wales*
- *The Council’s current levels of support for / and partnership arrangements with Higher Education Establishments in Cardiff*
- *The appropriateness of these levels of support*

- *Whether there is scope to improve and expand support for Higher Education Innovation*
- *Examples of good practice from relevant local authorities and universities.”*

The short scrutiny was conducted during Committee’s public meetings on 4 July and 5 September 2013. Witnesses from Cardiff’s four universities, start up companies Q-Chip and Medaphor, Manchester City Council, the Cabinet Member for Finance and Economic Development and officers from the Council’s Economic Development Directorate all contributed evidence to the short scrutiny.

Student Start-up Strategy

University of South Wales
Prifysgol De Cymru

Engagement	Empowerment	Equipping
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inspiring and fun workshops • Masterclasses • Competitions • Global Entrepreneurship Week 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Skills development • Business Surgeries • E-venture platform • CPD for Educators • Live project briefs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bright Ideas Den • Fairwood Trust Scholarships • Angel investors • Business Loft co-working space

The short scrutiny report² was agreed and submitted to the Cabinet in December 2013 for consideration of its 28 key findings and 15 recommendations.

Recommendations ranged from incubation space, advice and funding to promotion and community engagement.

At the time of publication of this annual report a Cabinet response is still awaited.

² <http://www.cardiff.gov.uk/ENG/Your-Council/Councillors-and-meetings/Scrutiny/Scrutiny-reports/Documents/Higher%20Education%20Innovation%20in%20Cardiff%202014.pdf>

Small Business in Cardiff



Councillors Dilwar Ali (left) and Craig Williams (third left) with representatives of the Federation of Small Business and local small business owners at the “Small Business Saturday” promotion in December 2013.

While developing its work programme for 2012 – 13, Committee had developed a strong and close relationship with the Federation for Small Businesses in Wales, and had become aware of the unique needs of small and micro businesses in Cardiff that constitute 24,400 individual small and medium sized enterprises, and 46% of its workforce. Members felt there was a risk that these unique needs were occasionally “hard to hear” in comparison with the macro economic needs of the city.

As a result, Committee agreed to arrange an in-depth Inquiry into Small Business, to establish:

- How small enterprises in the City and those wishing to move here are supported by the Council, in partnership with governmental and non-governmental agencies.
- How the Council's strategic approach operates and supports small businesses and whether it meets its objectives.
- How support is offered in appropriate areas, including training, staff recruitment, finding/providing suitable premises, sign posting to information including health and safety, taxation, employment law, business start-ups, planning and expansion, access to funding etc.
- The support given by other Councils to their small enterprises to identify best practice and value for money.
- Small enterprise perceptions of the role the Council plays and the services it provides e.g. Business Rates.

Councillors Craig Williams, Boyle, Bradbury and Dilwar Ali kindly volunteered for this Inquiry. They received evidence from the Federation of Small Businesses in Wales, various Council service areas, and commissioned desk research from the Scrutiny Research to explore the ways that the various local authorities deemed by the Department of Skills to be the "Best Councils To Do Business With" in 2012 supported small businesses.

Members also wanted to gauge the views of local small businesses, and did this in two ways:

They initially commissioned the Scrutiny Research Team to undertake a survey of small business perceptions of their economic outlook for the year ahead, and whether there was anything the Council could do to help improve their business prospects.

Small businesses were targeted through: existing forums and networks, press coverage in Wales Online and the Capital Times, Twitter, Linked In, direct mailing and person to person contact.



It netted 171 responses from small businesses in Cardiff, from a wide variety of locations and from a number of different business sectors.

They followed this up when with in May 2013 Michelle Davies (proprietor of the Rules of Play adventure gaming store in the Castle Arcade) kindly provided her premises for Members to hold a Listening Morning where various arcade store proprietors and Central Market stall holders gave their views on these issues.

The inquiry's report³ - including 14 key findings and 16 recommendations - was agreed in January 2014 and presented to Cabinet on 15 May 2014. A key concept the Committee was keen for the Cabinet to explore was the unique needs of small businesses, as opposed to those of Small to Medium Sized Enterprises. Other key areas of recommendation included procurement, swift payment, business rates, contact, liaison and promotion, and the concept of the "Cardiff Pound":

Having read the report, Dai Davies (South Wales Development Manager at the FSB) said:

"This is a useful report, which rightly recognises the unique needs of small businesses in our capital city. It reflects a number of the concerns raised by members who run businesses within Cardiff. We welcome a number of the recommendations of the scrutiny committee, including the suggestion that there should be more frequent measurement activity by size of business.

"Our members also warmly welcome the Committee's call for the Council's Cabinet to take advantage of its powers to provide business rates relief to small businesses affected by nearby development works. Such relief can make a considerable

³ <http://www.cardiff.gov.uk/ENG/Your-Council/Councillors-and-meetings/Scrutiny/Scrutiny-reports/Documents/Small%20business%20Report%202014.pdf>

difference to small businesses in the short-term and help to ensure their long-term sustainability.

“It is now vital that Cardiff Council responds positively to these recommendations, as doing so would be an important recognition of the role that small businesses play in creating a vibrant and varied economy in Cardiff.”

Cabinet's response is keenly awaited.

Alternative Operating Models in Leisure and Cultural Venues

At Committee's work programming forum in July 2013, the newly appointed Director of Sport, Leisure and Culture Chris Hespe explained to Members that given the financial challenges facing the Council, he would need to safeguard Cardiff's popular range of leisure and cultural venues by explore the potential savings available through alternative operating models. Recognising the importance of this agenda, Committee agreed support the Council in successfully navigating through this complex and hugely important topic by establishing a task and finish Inquiry into this area, chaired by Councillor Chris Weaver and including Councillors Dilwar Ali, Peter Bradbury and Nigel Howells. In April 2014 Councillor Bradbury became the Cabinet Member with Portfolio responsibility for leisure and culture.

The Inquiry Team received evidence from former Cabinet Portfolio Member Councillor Ramesh Patel and senior Sport, Leisure and Culture Directorate officers, the Director of Legal Services, Welsh Local Government Association advisors and other stakeholders. A visit to Bridgend enabled Members to meet responsible Council Members and officers, and to meet Halo Leisure Trust, a social enterprise established to manage leisure facilities on behalf of local authorities (including Bridgend Council), with the purpose of reinvesting any surpluses generated back into those authorities' leisure network. A meeting was also held with Parkwood, a

business which (amongst other contracts across the UK) manages leisure facilities in the Vale of Glamorgan on behalf of the Vale of Glamorgan Council, and the Cardiff International Pool. Parkwood have also recently developed a niche in the management and operation of arts venues in England.

In April 2014 the newly appointed Council Leader Councillor Phil Bale asked the Scrutiny Inquiry Team if they would be minded as part of the Inquiry to contribute ideas to a report being prepared into the matter for Cabinet's 15 May 2014 meeting. While this did not form part of the Inquiry's original terms of reference, given the growing urgency of seeking solutions in this area the Committee Chair and Inquiry Team Members agreed to consider this proposal.

The Inquiry team recognised four constraints to its capacity to fully inform the Cabinet report:

- Given the complexity of these agendas and the level of expertise required, Committee would have wished to receive further evidence and research data to fully form strategic and legally and financially robust key findings and recommendations;
- The speed with which this opportunity had arisen gave limited time to appropriately evaluate the balance of financial saving and social benefit that might be deemed appropriate;
- The Group had not benefited from sight of the draft Cabinet report to inform its consideration;
- The Group recognised that for Scrutiny to provide impartial and "critical friend" advice to the Cabinet it would need to retain its independence and enable the wider Committee to be able to hold the Cabinet to account for the decisions that it makes.

In a spirit of co-operation, the Chair and Inquiry team consented to support the pre-Decision scrutiny of this Cabinet report by holding two additional meetings of the task and finish group to help Committee provide feedback to eight key questions raised by Cabinet Member Councillor Peter Bradbury. These questions were:

- Financial surety versus delivery of social objectives - where we might sit on a spectrum, and how much room for manoeuvre there might be.
- Financial surety versus quality of provision - how much of a "blue chip" operation the Council wishes to deliver / can afford to deliver.
- How much control the Council would wish to exercise over the operations of a third party provider.
- Capital resourcing requirement - whether the Council would prefer to provide capital investment itself to potentially secure a better revenue "deal", or whether it would prefer a provider to meet these capital costs.
- How much community involvement the Council would wish to assure through the process - eg through social enterprise / trust.
- How much risk the Council would prefer to transfer to an operator, and how much it would wish to retain for the Council to bear.
- The level of protection the Council would wish to afford to existing staff through the process in the short and medium term.
- Are any particular models of operation generally preferred by the Council?

The Inquiry Team provided some written thoughts for Committee Members to consider at their meeting on 8 May, as part of the pre-decision process. These were then tailored into Scrutiny Report as part of a Cabinet paper seeking agreement for a process of procurement which Cabinet considered at their meeting on 15 May 2014⁴.

Having read the scrutiny report, Peter Gomer (Policy Adviser for Leisure, Culture, Tourism and Heritage at the Welsh Local Government Association) commented:

“This report captures the whole essence of the thought and decision making process that has to be gone through in a City of Cardiff’s importance. It also fully captures the options appraisal work that is fundamental to the development of a new delivery methodology in Cardiff. The members and officers in Cardiff should be congratulated

⁴ http://formerly.cardiff.gov.uk/objview.asp?object_id=28716

for their professionalism and intellect in tackling such a complex area so effectively”.

In his letter of response to the Committee’s report, Councillor Bradbury said:

The Leader, other Cabinet Members, the Director and I found the Inquiry report to be a first class, in-depth analysis which was used to guide the Cabinet decision made on 15 May 2014. The thoroughness of the Scrutiny process gave confidence to Cabinet that the complexities and nuances of this topic had been considered in detail.

I would like to place on record my appreciation of the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee, yourself as Chair and in particular Councillors Chris Weaver, Dilwar Ali and Nigel Howells who took on this task with gusto and energy, recognising the importance of the Council making the right decision on its leisure and culture portfolio.

In my view, the process of detailed scrutiny prior to a Cabinet decision worked extremely well in this instance.”

On 15 May, Cabinet agreed to progress options for procurement of alternative operating models.

The Committee recognises that this topic will remain a significant priority for the Council in years to come, and may consider follow up work as part of its 2014 – 15 Work Programme. Immediate priorities might revolve around public consultation on these proposals as a part of the forthcoming “Cardiff Debate”, and the specification of any tender documents stemming from the work,

Central Market and Historic Arcades

Following on from the Small Business Inquiry, Committee took forward an idea that had first been shared during 2012 – 13, of undertaking a new Inquiry into the role and potential of the City's Central Market and its unique Edwardian Shopping Arcades in developing the city's commercial and tourist offer.

The Members volunteering to take part in this Inquiry were Councillors Craig Williams (Chair), Weaver, Phillips, Holden and Darren Williams.

The terms of reference of the Inquiry were to:

- Understand the Council's role in running and supporting Central Market and the Arcades
- Understand the importance of Cardiff Central Market and the Arcades to the local economy
- Explore options for the future of Cardiff Central Market and the Arcades
- Review good practice from other Local Authorities in their support and promotion of Markets and Arcades
- Review public opinion and awareness of Cardiff Central Market and Arcades
- Understand the views of market stall owners and arcade store owners
- Understand the implications of a potential Business Improvement District proposed for Cardiff and the impact this will have for Central Market and the Arcades

Since the economic downturn and with the changing face of the city centre, Committee wanted to examine the importance of the Central Market and Historic Arcades to the City as a retail and tourist destination, and the role in which the Council can support traders to ensure the market and arcades remain a thriving part



Committee Chair Councillor Craig Williams consults a Central Market stall holder to gauge her perceptions of the Market and the Council's role in managing it.

of the city centre economy. Members have so far met stakeholders involved in the Market and Arcades, academics with research and policy knowledge, and managers of other central markets in other local authorities. A public perception survey was undertaken in April by the Scrutiny Research Team, with almost 2,000 members of the public providing their views, and each market stall holder and arcade shop owner has been given the opportunity to give their opinions.

It is anticipated that this inquiry will be completed in July 2015, with recommendations being submitted to the Councils decision makers following its approval.

CALL INS

Land at Heath Park – Cabinet Decision CAB/13/00125 (8 May 2014)

On 10 April 2014 Cabinet took a decision not to approve the disposal of public open space at Heath Park to accommodate an extension of the miniature railway operated by Cardiff Model Engineering Society (CMES), and not to agree (as managing trustee of the King George V Field) a proposal to ask Fields In Trust to consent to the proposal to extend the miniature railway.

Councillor Fenella Bowden, Ward Member for Heath Ward, called in this decision within the terms of the Council's call-in procedure, and Committee considered the Call-in on 8 May 2014. The grounds for Councillor Bowden's Call-in surrounded three areas:

- the way Ward Member comments on the proposal were paraphrased in the report, which she felt might have given a misleading impression of their views
- the analysis of public consultation data on the proposals
- the wording of part two of Cabinet's resolution.

Committee heard evidence from Cabinet Member for the Environment Councillor Bob Derbyshire, Director of Sport, Leisure and Culture Chris Hespe and other Heath Ward Members Councillors Lyn Hudson and Graham Hinchey. Written evidence was also received from Heath Residents Association and a volunteer with the CMES.

On the basis of the evidence received Committee decided not to refer the Decision back to the Cabinet. The Committee Chair wrote to the Cabinet Member to ask him to revise the wording of part two of the Decision to make it clearer, and to suggest that it might be helpful for guidance to be drawn up to ensure a consistent approach to the other two areas of concern listed above.

POLICY DEVELOPMENT

Committee was pleased to have been asked to provide cross party Member feedback to support areas of economic and cultural policy being developed by Cabinet Members and service directorates.

6 June 2013: Marine Industry in Cardiff Bay

- Exploring with the British Marine Federation the opportunities for the Council to maximise the economic impact and public enjoyment of Cardiff's unique marine environment.

6 June 2013: Channel View NEETS Project

- Considering the success of a Council pilot project using the leisure venue at Channel View as an opportunity to engage young people who are not in formal education, employment or training.

4 July 2013: Cardiff Business Council

- Engaging the Cabinet Member and newly appointed inaugural Chair of the CBC Nigel Roberts to assess the priorities and proposed activities of the Council in its first year of operation.

3 October 2013: Digital Cardiff Strategy

- Exploring the potential of the £11.9 million Department for Culture, Media and Sport funding to turn Cardiff into a Super Connected City, develop the economic capacity of Cardiff businesses, and create a data centre for Cardiff.

31 October 2013: Into Work Advice Services

- Clarifying how the former Local Training and Enterprise Service would remain resilient, extend its outreach activity and spread across the whole of Cardiff given a 50% cut in funding in the Council's 2013/14 budget.

9 January 2014: City Centre Business Improvement District

- Considering opportunities for engaging businesses in the city centre area in a BID to enable them to generate funding to meet their priorities for commercial and economic development.

9 January 2014: International Convention Centre Update

- Reviewing progress being made to develop a major convention centre and indoor arena and the impact of these proposals on inward investment in Cardiff – in the light of competitive bids also being developed by Bristol Council and the Newport Celtic Manor resort.

6 March 2014: Intermediate Assisted Area Status

- Examining proposals being submitted to Welsh Government as part of a regional collaboration for the designation of various parts of Cardiff as Assisted Areas, to generate potential regional funding for the purposes of economic development.

3 April 2014: Adult and Community Learning in Cardiff.

- Identifying how the Neighbourhood Learning Service could evolve to meet revised funding guidelines from Welsh Government to meet the needs of priority learners in areas such as basic skills, English for Speakers of Other languages and ICT, whilst preserving as far as possible on a self-funding basis a programme of non-priority courses and classes that will meet the expectations of local adult learners.

At the end of each of the above policy development meetings, Members wrote to the appropriate Cabinet Member with their observations, comments and recommendations to boost the performance, accessibility and efficiency of these services. Cabinet Members considered the ideas, and wrote back to indicate which of the ideas they would be able to adopt. Any readers interested in finding out more are welcome to contact Scrutiny Services for further information.

PRE-DECISION SCRUTINY

Year two of an Administration keen to show that “Cardiff Was Back in Business” brought a significant number of major decisions on economic and cultural matters to scrutiny prior to their being presented to Cabinet for decision.

5 September 2013: Central Cardiff Enterprise Zone Report

- Members gave confidential feedback on a proposal for the Council to procure the freehold and leasehold interests of several commercial buildings and packages of land in the area immediately around Central Square.

3 October 2013: IAAF World Half Marathon 2016

- Members considered the potential benefits and risks to Cardiff Council and the wider city economy in submitting a proposal to host this major event which was likely to attract up to 20,000 participants and potentially raise substantial revenues for the city.

31 October 2013: Flat Holm Island: Community Asset Transfer

- Members considered and commented upon expressions of interest received from charities, social enterprises and other organisations for the future operation of Flatholm, which had been the subject of one of Committee’s Inquiries during 2012/13.

9 January 2014: Saving the Coal Exchange

- Members considered the risks and opportunities inherent in Cabinet proposals to shore up the historic heart of Cardiff’s dockland infrastructure and to develop it into a thriving commercial and creative hub.

10 February 2014: 2014/15 Budget Proposals and Draft Corporate Plan

- Members deliberated and advised at length on the extensive budgetary savings proposals for services falling under Committee’s terms of

reference submitted by the Cabinet to meet the Council's very challenging financial challenges for 2013/14. Evidence was heard from:

- managers and Cabinet Members responsible for Economic Development, Neighbourhood Learning, Libraries, Community Into Work Services, Parks, Leisure and cultural services
- service users and partners of many of those services and
- trustees of charities currently supported by the Council whose grant funding was facing significant or total reduction.

6 March 2014: Cardiff Riding School – Community Asset Transfer

- Committee had the pleasure of supporting a Cabinet proposal NOT to transfer the Riding School to community management, but to work in an enhanced partnership with the recently constituted Friends of Riding School to retain the School as a commercially sustainable Council owned and managed venue, in the spirit of recommendations made in Committee's April 2013 task and finish Inquiry on this topic.

3 April 2014: Euro 2020 Football Championships

- Committee considered and provided feedback on the opportunities and risk of Cabinet deciding to support Cardiff's candidature as a host city for the 2020 European Football Championships

8 May 2014: Alternative Operating Models in Leisure & Cultural Venues

- Members provided extended pre-decision feedback on a Cabinet proposal to explore procurement of external alternative operating models for its fleet of leisure centres, St David's Hall and New Theatre. Committee provided advice on how to preserve quality, social benefits and Council control, while seeking to optimise revenue savings from working with external partner organisations.

15 May 2014: Central Square Regeneration – Next Steps.

- Members gave confidential feedback and their support with certain caveats for a proposal for the Council to procure the leasehold interest in the NCP Car Park on Wood Street. This was seen as the “final piece” in a jigsaw that would see the Council owning the freehold and leasehold of all land holdings around Central Square, to enable significant redevelopment, facilitation of a new transport hub, and public realm enhancements.

Any readers interested in learning more about the feedback provided by Committee are welcome to contact Scrutiny Services for further information.

PERFORMANCE MONITORING

Committee asked to monitor budgetary and service performance of various aspects of service delivery falling within Committee's terms of reference during the year.

31 October 2013: Directorate Budget Briefing Reports

- Directorate reporting through this Committee provided a basket of information to help Committee prepare for the scrutiny of budget proposals that would be coming through in Cabinet's February 2014 draft budget for 2014/15.

28 November 2013: Welsh Public Library Standards

- Members met the Independent Assessor of Public Library Standards in Wales Professor Hywel Roberts and colleagues from Welsh Government's Museums Libraries and Archives Division (CyMAL) to assess Cardiff's good progress in meeting the WPLS for 2012/13.

6 March 2014: Sport, Leisure and Culture Directorate Budget Savings

- Soon after the Directorate agreed its significantly reduced budget and increased income targets for 2013/14, Members asked the Director and Assistant Director to give Committee comfort in the methods that would be employed to achieve targets during the year. As a result, Committee agreed to take a more rigorous and consistent approach to monitoring of budgetary performance during 2014/15.

3 April 2014: Cardiff Community Learning Network Estyn Action Plan

- In January 2013 Her Majesty's Inspectorate for Education Estyn provided an "Inadequate" rating for the Cardiff Community Learning Network. Members invited the Partnership Co-ordinator for the recently constituted Cardiff Community Learning Partnership, the Cabinet Member for Education and Skills and partners from Cardiff and Vale College to attend Committee how describe progress with plans to

improve the performance of adult learning partners in Cardiff were progressing.

3 April 2014: Cardiff & Vale College – ESOL and Basic Skills franchise.

- Members were pleased to receive evidence from the Vice Principals for Curriculum and Quality, and for Administration and Finance from Cardiff and Vale College that showed significantly improved outcomes in Adult Basic Education (ABE) and English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) since the College took the franchise for managing these services back in-house a year ago. A tutor rep also spoke of improved communication and inclusion of staff, and the College also offered Members the opportunity to meet and speak directly to learners via a visit to be planned this summer.

Members hope that the verbal and written feedback they provided the officers and Cabinet Members during these monitoring sessions will be of benefit in optimising service provision in the future. Any readers interested in finding out more about this are welcome to contact Scrutiny Services for further information.

DEVELOPING A COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME FOR 2014/15

There is potential during 2014 – 15 to take forward a significant number of additional ideas shared during Committee’s July 2013 work programming forum that could not be programmed during 2013 – 14. Changing organisational and political priorities will also give rise to further opportunities as Members consolidate their forthcoming work programme during the early summer of 2014.

In undertaking their work programming forum, Members will consider a wide range of potential topics across the Committee’s terms of reference, including those stemming from the Council’s Corporate Plan, current organisational and performance issues, media and public interest topics, national and regional policy developments, and the priorities expressed by Cabinet Members, other Councillors, managers, key stakeholders and citizens at large.

Below is a list of topics that Committee has previously signalled an intention to cover, which could also be considered as candidates for scrutiny in 2014 – 15:

Items Logged on Committee’s Work Programme for pre-Decision Scrutiny pending presentation to Cabinet

- Directorate Delivery Plans for 2014/15
- “Rebuilding Momentum” Economic Vision White Paper
- Major Events Strategy
- Cardiff Bay Development Strategy.

Items discussed as potential Committee topics for 2013 – 14 that have not yet come forward for scrutiny

- Strategic Leisure Framework (Facilities strategy, green spaces hierarchy, National Concert Hall for Wales 10 year vision, Leisure Hubs etc)
- Maintenance of Leisure Facilities and Venues

- “Sport in Cardiff” - Status Report
- Cardiff Film Unit
- The Branding of Cardiff
- City Regions.

Cabinet responses to Committee’s Inquiry Reports

- Innovation in Higher Education Short Scrutiny
- Small Business
- Alternative Operating Models in Leisure and Cultural Venues
- Cardiff Central Market and Historic Arcades.

Topics clearly identified as appropriate priorities emerging from existing Committee work

- Supporting the emerging commissioning framework and public consultation on new models of leisure and cultural venue operation.

Appendix 1

Items that Committee considered during the Municipal Year

In-depth Inquiries

- Innovation in Higher Education – reported, awaiting Cabinet response
- Small Business – reported, awaiting Cabinet response
- Alternative Operating Models in Leisure and Cultural Venues – in progress
- Cardiff Market and Arcades – in progress

6 June 2013:

- Cardiff Bay's Marine Industry
- Channel View NEETs Project

4 July 2013:

- Cardiff Business Council

5 September 2013:

- Innovation in Higher Education Short Scrutiny
- Central Cardiff Enterprise Zone Report
- Committee's Work Programme for 2013-14

3 October 2013:

- Digital Cardiff Strategy
- European City of Sport – Briefing
- Innovation in Higher Education Report – Agreement of Recommendations
- IAAF World Half Marathon 2016

31 October 2013:

- Directorate Budget Briefing Reports
- Flat Holm Island: Community Asset Transfer Options
- Into Work Advice Services

28 November 2013:

- Welsh Public Library Standards
- Innovation in Higher Education – Adoption of Draft Report
- Local Development Plan – Committee representation on T&F Group

9 January 2014:

- Small Business Task and Finish – Adoption of Draft Report
- City Centre Management / Business Improvement District
- Saving the Coal Exchange / Convention Centre Update

10 February 2014:

- Cabinet's 2014/15 Budget Proposals and Draft Corporate Plan

6 March 2014:

- Cardiff Riding School – Community Asset Transfer Options
- Sport, Leisure and Culture – Plans for Implementing Budget Savings
- Intermediate Assisted Area Status

3 April 2014:

- Cardiff Community Learning Network Estyn Action Plan
- Cardiff & Vale College – ESOL and Basic Skills Franchise
- Adult and Community Learning in Cardiff
- Euro 2020 Football Championships

8 May 2014:

- Call in of Cabinet Decision CAB/13/00125 (Land at Heath Park)
- Alternative Operating Models in Leisure and Cultural Venues
- Committee's Work Programme for 2014/15

15 May 2014:

- Central Square Regeneration – Next Steps

Scrutiny Services, City of Cardiff Council
Room 243, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk
© 2014 City of Cardiff Council

scrutiny



A Report of: Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Annual Report 2013 – 2014

June 2014



The City & County of Cardiff

CONTENTS

Contents	2
Environmental Scrutiny Committee Membership	3
Chair's Foreword	4 - 5
Introduction	6 - 8
Inquires	9 - 16
Pre Decision Scrutiny	17 - 25
Performance Monitoring	26 - 29
Briefing Information	30 - 41
Recommended Future Work Programme	42 - 43

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Paul Mitchell
(Chairperson)



Councillor Elizabeth Clark



Councillor Bob Derbyshire



Councillor Keith Hyde



Councillor Roderick McKerlich



Councillor Chris Lomax



Councillor Sarah Merry



Councillor Jacqueline Parry



Councillor Monica Walsh

Note: Councillor Derbyshire left the Committee in April 2014.

CHAIR'S FOREWORD

This has been a productive year for the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with an administration which is keen to ensure that scrutiny is just not a reactive body but one which has a constructive role to play in local government through reviews, working groups and cross-party pre-decision scrutiny; in this respect I believe Cardiff is now well ahead of many other authorities.

2013/14 has been one of the most challenging years that I can remember in my time as a Councillor. Extreme financial pressures have forced the Council to fundamentally review how services are delivered and how it helps citizens manage everyday problems - every month it seems has presented the Council with a new challenge. In my first year as Chair of the Environmental Scrutiny I am proud of the way the cross-party Committee and their supporting staff have worked as a team to consider the challenges at hand; their professional and collective approach has provided honest evaluation and positive contributions on a wide range of subjects that shape our city.

During the year we have looked at a number of key issues especially the Cardiff Outdoors Project; the Control of Dangerous Dogs in Cardiff; Ward Based Cleansing Trials; Sustainable Energy Options for Cardiff; Cardiff's Strategic Transport Vision and Greener Grangetown. The Dangerous Dogs report has been presented in the House of Lords and the Assembly in an attempt to secure Dog Control Notices in the UK and Wales. In addition to this the Committee has supported a Joint Task and Finish Inquiry on the Local Development Plan (LDP) that has provided a critical analysis of the most important and statutory key document for the capital city of Wales.

Another £120M of cuts are forecast over the next three years so the next 12 months will provide a far tougher challenge than the last as the Council has to quickly adapt to protect as many services as it can. The Committee will have to focus on a smaller number of key issues facing the Council so that our support and impact is maximised – and will have to do so against very tight

deadlines. We will be building on the work done during the Cardiff Outdoors inquiry and scrutinising a range of Alternative Delivery Models for the provision of a number of Environmental Services. This will be an intensive and difficult task but I am sure the Committee is more than capable of meeting this challenge.

We will also need to review the development of a new Waste Management Strategy, the Council's drive to produce more renewable energy and plans to develop a new bus station for the city; these will all demand our attention. The LDP has now been lodged with the Planning Inspector ahead of its formal deposit in October 2015 and already there are many queries about infrastructure that this Committee may need to address. Prosiect Gwyrdd, the closure of the Lamby Way landfill site and implementation of an organic waste processing facility will also be on the scrutiny radar during the year.

In closing, I would like to thank the Committee Members for their support and the witnesses who were good enough to give up their time to provide evidence. Finally I would like to thank the officers in Scrutiny and Member Services who have helped organise the meetings; without this support none of the work would be possible.



**Councillor Paul Mitchell, Chairperson
Environmental Scrutiny Committee
June 2014**

INTRODUCTION

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service and policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of transport, sustainability, and waste. This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2013 - 14 and, wherever possible, identifies the impact that the Committee has had.

Between July 2013 and June 2014 the Committee scrutinised a wide range of topics. These have been listed below against four general types of scrutiny adopted during the year:

Inquiries - Where the Committee has undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet.

- Problem & Nuisance Parking in Cardiff – Review of the Draft Report;
- Cabinet Response to the Report of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Entitled “Litter in Cardiff”;
- Control of Dangerous Dogs in Cardiff – Review of the Draft Report;
- Cardiff Outdoors – Land Management & Commercial Opportunities;
- Local Development Plan Deposit Plan (this was a Joint exercise led by the Policy Review & Performance Committee).

Pre Decision Scrutiny - This provides the Committee with an opportunity to evaluate and comment on policy proposals before they go to the Council's Cabinet, and this gives the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision.

- Regionalising Regulatory Services Across Cardiff, Bridgend & the Vale of Glamorgan;
- Review of the business case for the enforcement of bus lanes & other moving traffic contraventions;
- Corporate Plan 2014-17 and Budget Proposals 2014/15;

- Bereavement & Registration Services Strategy;
- Greener Grangetown – Delivery Plans;
- Cardiff’s Strategic Transport Vision;
- 2014/15 Budget Strategy - Early Consideration of Proposals - City Analyst Laboratory;
- One Planet Cardiff – Member Briefing;
- Highway Maintenance Policy & Safety Inspections;
- Draft Environment Directorate Delivery Plan – 2014/15;
- Draft Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Delivery Plan – 2014/15.

Performance Monitoring - Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council’s performance.

- Performance Management Information – March 2014;
- Ward Based Cleansing Trial;
- Organic Waste Treatment Solution – Procurement Update;
- Budget Briefing Report – Environment Directorate & Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Directorate.

Briefing Information - Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject which has environmental implications to the Council and the City.

- Atlantic Wharf Crane – Verbal Briefing;
- Urban Gulls;
- Managing Litter on Private Land & Property Frontages;
- Introduction & Implementation of ‘CarbonCulture’ in Cardiff;
- Cardiff Real Nappy Bank – Briefing Report;
- School Traffic Safety;
- Cardiff – An Energy Resilient City;
- Income Generation from Recycling;
- Alternative delivery model for the Hayes Public Conveniences - Briefing Paper;

- Greener Grangetown – Delivery Plans;
- Closure and aftercare of Lamby Way landfill site and continued aftercare of the Ferry Road closed landfill site;
- Cardiff Council – Implementation of a Zero Tolerance Approach to Waste;
- Sustainable Energy Options for Cardiff;
- Briefing on the results of the Waste Strategy Consultation Exercise;
- Position Paper on Metro proposals and implications for Cardiff;
- Bus Routes & Subsidies;
- Ensuring High Standards of Food Safety in Cardiff.

This report summarises the Committee's activities during 2013 – 14 and sets out the comments and observations made by Members on the Committee.

INQUIRIES

Problem & Nuisance Parking in Cardiff

At their meeting on the 2nd July 2013, Members received an item titled 'Problem & Nuisance Parking in Cardiff – Review of Draft Report'. Running the task & finish exercise was agreed at the Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting in March 2013. The agreed terms of reference for the inquiry were to look at a range of problem parking types and:

- Consider the diverse car parking problems experienced in Cardiff;
- Examine the extent / impact of the problem and the areas most affected;
- Examine what work has been undertaken to date in order to try and solve the problem;
- Examine the Council approach for addressing parking problems in the city;
- Examine if local, national and European legislation can be applied in certain areas to manage parking problems;
- Consider how the Council and other parties can raise awareness on parking issues;
- Discuss what possible solutions could be used to rectify the situation and then analyse the costs and benefits of those possible solutions;
- Discuss the actions that the Council can take to 'future proof' Cardiff against parking and other parking problems, for example, use of effective planning regulations, applying regulations to safeguard key routes;
- Consider examples of best practice for dealing with parking issues in other areas.

The problem & nuisance parking types explored in the inquiry were:

- Parking on pavements, verges, cycle lanes, bus lanes and near schools;
- Using the public highway to illegally sell vehicles and use of mobile advertising displays;
- Commuter parking in residential areas;
- Unlicensed or unregistered vehicles.

The report made a number of recommendations including:

- The Council provides all Civil Parking Enforcement Officers with a suitable badge camera system as soon as possible;
- The Council should introduce a 'car cam' system to help enforce parking & traffic regulations created by the new school safety zones.
- The Council should run a city-wide campaign to raise the profile of the new school safety zones; in doing this they should clearly emphasise the safety benefits of the new scheme.
- That 'Supplementary Planning Guidance for Access, Circulation & Parking Standards' should be revised to include a clearer definition of 'parking saturation'.
- When implementing new or updating existing cycle lanes the Council should do more to identify appropriate locations which allow the competing priorities to co-exist, and where possible to create segregated cycle lanes.
- Where significant damage is caused to verges on a regular basis and a large number of complaints are received, the Council should consider using specific Traffic Regulation Orders to improve management of the problem.
- Where appropriate, single yellow lines supported by short term parking signs are used at sites where it has been established that vehicles are illegally sold on a regular basis.
- That the Council contacts Cardiff Magistrates Court to arrange a briefing session on the illegal selling of vehicles on the public highway and to encourage a more consistent approach to the issue.
- That the residential parking permit criteria are reviewed with consideration being given to:
 - Asking for resident parking permit holders to provide a V5 registration document; a licence number plate; a driving licence and a valid insurance certificate;
 - Owners of low emission vehicles receiving a discount against the cost of purchasing a residential parking permit;

- Specialist city-wide residential parking permits are made available for care workers and other health & social care professionals.
- All new businesses locating to the city implement a robust travel plan which sets out how employees and members of the public get to and from their premises.
- Cardiff Council works with transport providers, local universities and the student's union to help develop a Cardiff student travel card which would provide the option of discounted travel for all students based in the city.
- The Council liaises with the local universities and asks them to reinforce the message that it is not necessary for students to bring their vehicles to Cardiff as suitable travel alternatives are available.

The Members of the Committee endorsed the draft report and it was submitted for consideration at the Cabinet meeting held on the 7th November 2013. A response to the report is due to be presented at Cabinet in 2014. The Environmental Scrutiny Committee will consider the Cabinet response once it is available.

Cabinet Response to the Report of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Entitled "Litter in Cardiff"

This inquiry was started by Members in September 2012 and explored a number of important litter issues (including dog fouling, smoking litter, chewing gum, fly tipping and incorrectly presented waste) and spoke to 32 expert witnesses. The exercise established public opinion through its litter survey by persuading almost 2,500 people to complete the survey. The report made 13 recommendations which included:

- Creating a strategy for dealing with dog fouling in Cardiff; implementing 'Dog Control Zones' in Cardiff; supporting the Control of Dogs (Wales) Bill which is being considered by the Welsh Government; publicising the dangers created by dog fouling through the use of shock-driven or controversial dog fouling posters and signs; developing an effective way to record all reported dog fouling incidents; extending Police Community

Support Officer and Urban Park Ranger trials for issuing dog fixed penalty notices to all wards; reviewing the case for providing Education and Enforcement Officers with overt body cameras and to start naming and shaming people who commit dog fouling offences.

- Creating strategies for dealing with smoking related litter, chewing gum, fast food litter and all other forms of general street litter.
- Review the implementation of a Business Improvement District in Cardiff and lease or hire a chewing gum removal machine.
- Implement a litter awareness education project which would target all primary and secondary schools in Cardiff.
- In relation to fly tipping the Council should arrange for a presentation to be delivered to local magistrates on the environmental and financial impact of fly tipping in Cardiff and the South East Wales region; the Council should use GPS technology to track and monitor fly-tipping incidents which could be shared with partners like the Environment Agency; the Council in partnership with the Environment Agency should do more to publicise that individuals are responsible for ensuring that their waste is removed by a compliant waste carrier and that failure to do this could result in a substantial fine.
- Evaluate the implementation of street cleansing on a zonal basis.

The draft report was presented to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee for consideration on the 13th March 2013. The Cabinet response for this report was delivered on the 5th April 2013 and reported back to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee on the 5th September 2013. Eleven of the thirteen recommendations were accepted with two being partially accepted.

Control of Dangerous Dogs in Cardiff

At the Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting on the 5th September 2013, it was agreed that a Joint Task and Finish Group involving Members from the Environmental Scrutiny Committee and the Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee would undertake an inquiry to review the Control of Dangerous Dogs in Cardiff. The agreed terms of reference for the inquiry were to review the potential impact that the 'Anti-social Behaviour Crime &

Policing Bill' would have on managing dangerous dogs in Cardiff and the implications this will have for Cardiff Council. In doing this the inquiry reviewed and evaluated:

- Who holds the responsibility for managing dangerous dogs in Cardiff;
- The resources allocated to manage dangerous dogs in Cardiff;
- The current legislation used to manage dangerous dogs in Cardiff;
- The proposed legislation being created to manage dangerous dogs;
- The scale of the dangerous dogs problem in Cardiff;
- The merits of the recently shelved 'Control of Dogs (Wales) Bill' compared against the 'Anti-social Behaviour Crime & Policing Bill';
- Best practice for dealing with dangerous dogs;
- Educational and partnership approaches for managing dangerous dogs.

The report made 20 recommendations which included:

- Proactively promote free micro chipping to dog owners in Cardiff in line with the Welsh Government commitment to compulsory micro chipping.
- Publicly support the view that specific measures need to be available for dogs, rather than generic Community Protection Notices, and therefore apply pressure to the Welsh Government to reintroduce the Control of Dogs (Wales) Bill should Home Office legislation not meet this requirement.
- Explore the extension of public areas and parks where Public Space Protection Orders can be applied in relation to the control of dogs.
- Increase the number of responsible dog ownership community events held in Cardiff, focussed in areas known to have status dog ownership issues. These should be run in a partnership approach to include the police, charities and commercial organisations; utilising community outreach workers; and taking advantage of social media networks to promote events and reach marginalised individuals.
- Links with Cardiff North Royal Mail Delivery Office to obtain and contribute to the 'Walk Log' that has been developed, and seek to share this amongst all relevant partner organisations who undertake visits to private properties

(subject to data protection legislative requirements). The Council work with the Royal Mail to capture information on properties across the City.

The draft report was presented to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee for consideration on the 10th December 2013. The Cabinet response for this report is due to be received in 2014.

Cardiff Outdoors – Land Management & Commercial Opportunities

The Cardiff Outdoors – Land Management & Commercial Opportunities task & finish exercise was started in November 2013. The aim of the inquiry has been to explore land management and commercial opportunities that fall within the scope of the 'Cardiff Outdoors' project. In doing so it has considered best practice techniques available to Cardiff Council and focused on the following areas:

- Vegetation Management;
- Sustainable Land Management & Biodiversity;
- Sponsorship & Advertising;
- Commercial Scope & Opportunities;
- Grant Management.

When evaluating the areas identified above the inquiry has considered the following:

- The current resources available across the Council to undertake the nominated tasks.
- Income generation opportunities available within Cardiff and the South East Wales Region.
- Best practice for land management and commercial opportunities that fall within the terms of reference of the 'Cardiff Outdoors' project.
- Rules and regulations which determine the scope of land management and commercial activity that the Council may undertake.
- Potential partnership working arrangements.

The task group has hosted nine meetings and received evidence from 29 witnesses. To date the task & finish group have produced three letters which were titled:

- Cardiff Outdoors – Overview Letter
- Cardiff Outdoors – Commercial Opportunities
- Cardiff Outdoors – Sponsorship

The task & finish group will produce several other letters before concluding their work in July 2014. These letters will consider the topics of vegetation management, land management and grant management. The letters will form the basis of a report which will be presented at the Environmental Scrutiny Committee on the 8th July 2014.

Local Development Plan – Deposit Plan inquiry

During September and October 2013 Members of the Environmental were involved in a Joint Committee task & finish exercise titled 'Local Development Plan – Deposit Plan Inquiry'; this was led by the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee. In support of the ongoing Local Development Plan process Joint Scrutiny Committee's had previously undertaken task & finish exercises into the Draft Preferred Strategy and the Draft Masterplanning General Principles. In reviewing the Draft Deposit Plan the group focused on the 'ten tests of soundness' and made a series of recommendations including:

- The public consultation be made as accessible as possible and that communication with both new and existing communities should be further considered in order to create an open dialogue;
- Monitoring arrangements should be established via the provision of an Annual Monitoring Report to this Committee;
- The Cabinet should work with partners to ensure appropriate phasing of delivery of community facilities and infrastructure;
- A Public Sector Asset Management Strategy via the Cardiff Partnership Board should be progressed;

- Transport proposals should be improved in discussion with Welsh Government and other partners with regards to a regional transport solution, and that early communication should take place with those residents who may be affected by any regional transport solutions;
- Site specific masterplans should take into account integrated facilities which make sustainable transport solutions viable, and ensure that they specify how affordable housing will be placed within each site;
- Members should be fully engaged in the development of the necessary policies and Supplementary Planning Guidance to support the delivery of the LDP;
- The Cabinet should pursue a regional solution for Gypsy and Traveller provision;
- A further inquiry should be established to consider the implications of the Community Infrastructure Levy and changes to Section 106 funding in more depth.

PRE DECISION SCRUTINY

Regionalising Regulatory Services Across Cardiff, Bridgend & the Vale of Glamorgan

At their meeting on the 4th June 2013, Members received an item titled 'Regionalising Regulatory Services Across Cardiff, Bridgend & Vale of Glamorgan – Member Briefing'. This provided Members with a summary of the collaborative work currently being undertaken to regionalise regulatory services across Cardiff, Bridgend and the Vale of Glamorgan. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members agreed that although the proposal was in its early stages the general principle of a Regional Regulatory Services Collaboration seemed like a good idea. They asked the Cabinet Member for the Environment to approach negotiations with the other prospective partners on the 28th June in a positive manner but still look to maintain Cardiff's interests.
- They questioned how a future collaboration exercise would work in terms of staffing implications, for example, potentially the service could be run by staff from each of the three authorities with different conditions of employment.
- That suitable governance and project management arrangements should be established as early as possible to avoid any confusion in terms of decision making and accountability for delivering services.
- The Committee felt that the implementation of the collaboration could impact on the moral and motivation of staff involved with the delivery of regulatory services in Cardiff. Members asked that the transition should be managed in a sensitive manner, particularly as the project involves the possibility of job losses.

2014/15 Budget Strategy - Early Consideration of Proposals - City Analyst Laboratory

At their meeting on the 14th January 2014, Members received an item titled

'2014/15 Budget Strategy - Early Consideration of Proposals - City Analyst Laboratory'. This provided Members with a summary of the 2014/15 Budget Strategy Proposals which related to the 'City Analyst Laboratory'. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- The Committee expressed their deep dissatisfaction with the information provided, and the presentation given for the item. They felt that the lack of any robust figures or information for Members to consider did not enable the Committee to scrutinise these proposals in any meaningful or satisfactory manner.
- Members recognised that, at a time when the Council is facing unprecedented levels of financial cuts, it is logical to review a service that is costing almost £200,000 a year to run. The Cardiff's food testing budget for 2014/15 was anticipated to be £90k.
- The Committee stated that they would not support the closure of such a valued service; particularly when the Committee was presented with financial information that was questionable at best and offered no viable alternatives for consideration. The Committee requested that the item was brought back prior to a final decision on the future of the City Analyst Laboratory being taken.

The Committee will review this item in the summer of 2014 following the outcome of an ongoing procurement exercise.

Review of the business case for the enforcement of bus lanes & other moving traffic contraventions

At their meeting on the 14th January 2014, Members received an item titled 'Review of the business case for the enforcement of bus lanes & other moving traffic contraventions'. As the title suggests this briefed Members on Cardiff Council's business case for receiving new powers to deal with the enforcement of bus lanes and other moving traffic contraventions. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- The Committee were pleased with, and supportive of, the Council's intention to assume responsibility for enforcement of bus lane and other moving traffic offences.
- The Committee recognised that income generation to be a by-product of the enforcement of the legislation, with the primary focus being improvements in traffic flow and reductions in congestion across the city.
- Members noted that the implementation of the legislation would require clear communication of the changes to motorists in Cardiff. They felt that this communication should emphasise the benefits to the transport network rather than the relevant financial penalties and charges. They asked that a copy of the communication plan for this initiative be shared with the Committee along with the results of the public consultation exercise.

Corporate Plan 2014-17 and Budget Proposals 2014/15

The Council's constitution allows for Scrutiny consideration of options generated for full Council in setting its budget. The Committee held a meeting on the 11th February 2014 to scrutinise the draft budgetary proposals for 2014/15, including: Savings Proposals; Capital Programme; and Financial Pressures. The appropriate Cabinet Members and officers attended the meeting. The Committee considered budget implications on a Cabinet portfolio basis. The meeting started with a Corporate Overview of the budget proposals for 2014/15. This was then followed by looking at the budget proposals for the Environment Portfolio and Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio. Officers then delivered presentations on the effects of the draft budget proposals on their areas of responsibility relevant to the selected portfolio. The relevant sections of the draft Corporate Plan 2014/17 were also considered at the meeting. Following the presentations and statements, Members questioned and discussed several areas of the budget including:

a. Corporate Overview – Budget Proposals

- Members questioned if the Council actually achieved any savings from the implementation of Single Status and requested a detailed financial summary of the Single Status process
- Members were concerned that the projected figure of £113.2 million for unsupported additional borrowing over the next five year appears exceptionally high. They felt that unsupported capital borrowing represented a significant risk to the Council's and urged that it should be carefully monitored and managed. They commented that it would be prudent to better manage this risk by establishing some type of long term fixed capital funding arrangement.
- Members asked for a list of assets and properties which had been disposed of by the Council during the 2013/14 financial year.

The Committee has received a response for this item; however, the letter stated that additional information on 'Single Status' and 'Capital Receipts' would follow. This information has yet to be provided.

b. Environment Portfolio

ENV 25 – Review of City Analyst Laboratory

Members were concerned at the lack of detail around this proposal and asked to consider the item again in the near future. In doing this they wanted to consider:

- A full financial summary of the City Analyst Laboratory;
- Details of how Cardiff's City Analyst Laboratory compares with other private sector competitors in terms of cost;
- Itemised list of the work undertaken by the City Analyst Laboratory;
- A list of potential alternative delivery models currently under consideration.

ENV 10 – HWRC Service Redesign

Members were concerned that the HWRC Service Redesign would have a 12 year payback period in terms of savings and questioned the sense of making such a large capital investment when the Council's budget is under intense pressure. They asked for confirmation that the proposed saving of £135,000 illustrated the full year effect and asked the Cabinet Member for the Environment to confirm if he felt that the £1.668 million capital investment on the Wedal Road site provided a good return on investment. They also asked for a projection of the anticipated improvements for recycling from Wedal Road site and the financial impact that this would produce. When commenting on the proposed development of the Wedal Road HWRC and closure of other HWRC's Members:

- Suggested that some type of local consultation should take place around the proposed expansion of the Wedal Road HWRC; this should include transport and noise impact assessments.
- Asked for clarification on the proposed closure dates for the Lamby Way and Waungron Road HWRC's.
- Asked for a realistic capital receipt value for the Waungron Road site and if the Council had considered any alternative proposals for the site.

ENV 32 – Enforcement Efficiencies

Members were sceptical that a £40,000 income increase could be achieved with fewer people. They asked for a detailed account on exactly how both of these proposals would be achieved.

SPH 56 – Reduction of External Spend

The savings proposal included a reduction in the drainage repairs budget of £25,000 and a £20,000 reduction in gully maintenance. Members asked the Cabinet Member to reconsider this saving proposal as recent severe weather events demonstrate that Cardiff is potentially vulnerable to flooding events.

SPH 62 – Reduction in Winter Maintenance

By taking £200,000 out of the winter maintenance budget Members were concerned that the Council was about to abandon a two year old winter maintenance policy which had yet to be tested. They asked for an analysis of the risk that the £200,000 saving represents and the financial impact that any associated insurance claims might have.

c. Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio

SPH 49 – Development Management additional Planning Fee income

Members accepted some of the comments made by the Director for Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transportation, for example, that a significant amount of work that we previously undertook for free could now incur a fee, however, they remain sceptical that this target can be achieved because of the reduction in planning staff. The Committee asked for:

- An update of the restructuring of the planning service at Committee in the summer of 2014.
- Assurance that the new process to be developed for smaller applications would ensure that a consistent and thorough approach is applied to all new applications. They were keen to avoid a 'light touch' approach as this could lead to difficulties such as an unsustainable increase in garden infill applications.
- Provide assurance that there would be sufficient capacity to manage incoming LDP and other large-scale applications.

SPH 76 – Staff savings across Planning Enforcement

The Committee were concerned that a £39,000 reduction in Planning Enforcement staff costs would lead to an increase in over development or potential blight disputes between neighbours. Members asked for assurance that the service would maintain sufficient resources to properly manage such issues.

Bereavement & Registration Services Strategy

At their meeting on the 8th April 2014, Members received an item titled 'Bereavement & Registration Services Strategy'. This provided Members with a briefing on the draft Bereavement & Registration Services Strategy due to be considered at the Cabinet meeting on the 10th April 2014. Once approved the Bereavement & Registration Services Strategy will set out how Cardiff Council will address bereavement and registration for the next 10 years. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members noted the difficulties in registering the death of Cardiff residents at Llandough Hospital due to it being located in the Vale of Glamorgan. As regional collaboration is now being encouraged by the Welsh Government they encouraged the Council to approach the Vale of Glamorgan to establish if it would be possible to locate a registrar at Llandough Hospital to register the death of Cardiff residents.
- The Committee asked that the Sport, Leisure & Culture Directorate investigate the potential for delivering a funeral pre payment service. If it was deemed viable then it should be included in the Bereavement & Registration Services Strategy.
- The Committee felt that other areas of the city were well served in terms of burial provision; therefore, it was only fair that the new strategy should include allocating more burial provision in the east of Cardiff as a priority.
- The Committee suggested that the Council should review the opening hours of the registration service.

Cardiff's Strategic Transport Vision

At their meeting on the 12th November 2013, Members received an item titled 'Cardiff's Strategic Transport Vision'. This briefed Members on Cardiff's Strategic Transport Vision and how this ties in with the Cardiff Local Development Plan 2006 – 2026: Deposit Plan. Considering the item allowed Members to provide detailed feedback to the Cabinet on the Transport sections of the Cardiff Local Development Plan 2006 - 2026: Deposit Plan.

Following the item the main comment made by Members was that the Committee was impressed with some of the transport proposals. They acknowledge that these were long term projects which would take many years and considerable funding to deliver, however, they are keen to add their support to initiatives like the Cardiff Capital Region Metro.

One Planet Cardiff – Member Briefing

At their meeting on the 7th May 2013, Members received an item titled 'One Planet Cardiff – Member Briefing'. This briefed Members on the draft 'One Planet Cardiff Vision' and Delivery Plan prior to it being presented at the Cabinet meeting on the 11th July 2014. The One Planet Cardiff Vision and Delivery Plan aimed to demonstrate the Council's leadership role in setting a clear sustainable development agenda for the city. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- That the Committee supported the work of the Council in developing a sustainability vision for Cardiff.
- Members asked for details of Cardiff's proposed district heating system to be provided for future scrutiny.
- Members asked for a briefing on the energy collective being developed in partnership with the Vale of Glamorgan as they were told that such a collective would deliver energy sustainability benefits and potential fuel savings for residents of Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan.

Highway Maintenance Policy & Safety Inspections

At their meeting on the 8th October 2013, Members received an item titled 'Highway Maintenance Policy & Safety Inspections'. The item was used to brief Members on the proposed changes to the Highway Maintenance Policy and the safety inspections process in Cardiff. This provided Members with an opportunity to comment on the proposals prior to consideration at Cabinet. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- The Committee asked that there should be more local Member consultation in the criteria driven highway repairs process; this included earlier notification of any planned works.
- At the meeting Members were told that revising the highway maintenance policy would provide additional support for Section 58 defences; this in turn should help reduce the value of insurance claims made against the Council. The Committee asked for an estimate on how much the Council anticipates will be saved as a result of the changes to the highway maintenance policy.

Draft Environment Directorate Delivery Plan – 2014/15

At their meeting on the 10th June 2014 Members received an item titled 'Draft Environment Directorate Delivery Plan – 2014/15'. This provided Members with the opportunity to scrutinise the draft Directorate Delivery Plan and explore how it links into the Corporate Plan objectives and service delivery in Cardiff.

At the time of approving the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Annual Report 2013/14 a response to requests made in relation to the 'Draft Environment Directorate Delivery Plan – 2014/15' was outstanding.

Draft Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Delivery Plan – 2014/15

At their meeting on the 10th June 2014 Members received an item titled 'Draft Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Directorate Delivery Plan – 2014/15'. This provided Members with the opportunity to scrutinise the draft Directorate Delivery Plan and explore how it links into the Corporate Plan objectives and service delivery in Cardiff.

At the time of approving the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Annual Report 2013/14 a response to requests made in relation to the 'Draft Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Directorate Delivery Plan – 2014/15' was outstanding.

PERFORMANCE MONITORING

Performance Management Information – March 2014

At their meeting on the 11th March 2014, Members received an item titled 'Performance Management Information – March 2014'. This enabled Members of the Committee to consider a range of current performance indicators relevant to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee's terms of reference. These were used to determine how effectively the relevant portfolio and service areas had performed and to identify issues of potential concern. The performance indicators were reviewed by portfolio; the portfolios relevant to the terms of reference of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee at the time were Environment and Strategic Planning & Transport. Officers from the Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport and Environment Directorates attended the meeting to address specific performance indicators and wider issues. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

Environment Portfolio

- The subject of local authority trading companies was discussed at the meeting. The Cabinet Member for the Environment explained that the Council was looking to establish a local authority trading company which would manage some services delivered by the Environment Directorate. Members stated that they would like to scrutinise any work undertaken by the Environment Directorate to establish a local authority trading company.
- Members were told that the Council was performing well against the STS/006 indicator which measures the percentage of reported fly tipping incidents cleared within five working days. They were told that the quarter 3 results for 2013/14 were the best for the last five years. The Committee asked for further information on the basis of this calculation and specifically how many incidents had happened in quarters one, two and three of 2013/14.

Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Portfolio

- PLA/003 measures the percentage of appeals determined that upheld the authority's decision in relation to planning application decisions and enforcement notices. Members were concerned that Quarter 2 performance had fallen to 44.8% when compared against the annual target of 65%. This left the rolling year to date figure at 57.6% with a 'RAG' status of Red. When asked for an explanation the Director for Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport was unsure of the exact reason and offered to provide the Committee with a definitive answer.
- A Member explained that planning enforcement was a very important issue in many parts of Cardiff. She was concerned that following the recent planning budget cuts it would be very difficult to maintain the same level of planning enforcement across Cardiff. She asked what type of strategies would be put in place to ensure that effective planning enforcement continues. The Director for Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport explained that work loads would increase, but more importantly officers would need to better prioritise enforcement cases. He later explained that a series of priorities were going to be developed for planning enforcement. The Committee asked for a copy of the priorities for planning enforcement.

At the time of approving the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Annual Report 2013/14 a response to the questions asked on the performance indicators relevant to the Transport, Planning & Sustainability Portfolio was outstanding.

Ward Based Cleansing Trial

At their meeting on the 8th April 2014, Members received an item titled 'Ward Based Cleansing Trial – Member Briefing'. This provided Members with an update on the Riverside ward based cleansing trial which started in the summer of 2013. The item also commented on the initial work undertaken in the second phase of the trial which is being conducted in the Fairwater and Pentwyn wards. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members felt that leaf collection should be carried out by teams taking part in the ward based cleansing trials and welcomed the assurance of the Cabinet Member for the Environment that the leaf problem would be resolved by the autumn.
- Members noted local Councillor comments that more should be done to improve the line of communication between the ward based teams and local Councillors.
- Members felt that the scrutiny function could offer you valuable support prior to any formal decision being taken at Cabinet regarding the cleansing service. They asked that any future cleansing proposals linked to ward based cleansing should include details of how the roll out of a new scheme would take place and detailed timescales.

Organic Waste Treatment Solution – Procurement Update

At their meeting on the 2nd July 2014, Members received an item titled 'Organic Waste Treatment Solution – Procurement Update'. This item, as the title suggested provided Members with an update on the Organic Waste Treatment Solution procurement exercise.

Budget Briefing Report – Environment Directorate & Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Directorate

At their meeting on the 12th November 2013, Members received an item titled 'Budget Briefing Report: Environment Directorate & Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Directorate'. This provided Members with background information on budget provision and structures for the Directorates that fell within the Committee's terms of reference. These were provided as preparation for the February 2014 scrutiny budget process. The item considered the budgets for the Environment Directorate and the Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Directorate. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

Environment Directorate

- Members agreed with comment that Cardiff should benchmark its environmental performance against other major cities in the United Kingdom and not just other Welsh authorities.

Members agreed that Cardiff had become over reliant on the Welsh Government waste grant to fund core services and that as the terms and conditions on this funding source can be varied it represents a significant financial risk to the Council. They encouraged the Cabinet Member to explore alternative ways to fund waste services which would reduce the reliance on such a grant.

- Members asked for details on the financial viability of the commercial waste service and an estimate of its commercial value in advance of the budget scrutiny meeting.

Strategic Planning, Highways, Traffic & Transport Directorate

- Members were concerned at the suggestion that the Council's planning department was not performing well, for example, the percentage of major applications which could be processed and completed within 13 weeks (most English authorities exceed 60% while Cardiff has averaged between 25% and 30% over the last two years). As a result of this and other planning proposals the Committee asked for an update on progress made within the planning service by the summer of 2014. They also suggested that it was a good time for the Directorate to review the planning performance indicators.

BRIEFING INFORMATION

Atlantic Wharf Crane – Verbal Briefing

At their meeting on the 7th May 2013, Members received an item titled 'Atlantic Wharf Crane – Verbal Briefing'. This briefed Members with information on the history of the crane and options for the future maintenance or removal of the crane. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members felt that the feature crane located on the Bute East Dock was a valuable piece of Cardiff's heritage. It was donated to the Council by the Association of British Ports, therefore, it was felt that the Council has a duty to properly maintain the structure. The Committee asked that the Council to find a way for the Council to maintain the crane, for example, finding private sponsorship or allocating funds from the Council budget.
- The Committee expressed concern that similar historic monuments could fall into disrepair if not properly monitored and maintained and asked for future updates on the process for monitoring and maintaining historical heritage owned by Cardiff Council.

Urban Gulls

At their meeting on the 7th May 2013, Members received an item titled 'Urban Gulls'. The item was used to provide Members with a briefing on Cardiff's urban gull population and a summary of what Cardiff Council can do to manage the gull population and the associated problems that they create. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members were satisfied that the Council was doing all it could to manage Cardiff's gull population. They noted that the urban gull population causes a range of problems that the Council has no effective tool for dealing with. A protected status has been applied to help protect gulls in the wild, however, urban populations are rapidly expanding and that some distinction needed to be applied which could help address the problems

caused by urban gulls. The Committee asked the Cabinet Member for the Environment to write to the Welsh Government asking them to acknowledge the problems caused by urban gulls and requesting that they provide more effective guidance on managing the urban gull population.

- The topic of managing pigeon populations under railway bridges was raised. An officer mentioned that she had a contact number for a team in Network Rail who could clear, remove and prevent pigeons from nesting under railway bridges. Members asked that this number is made available to Councillors.

Managing Litter on Private Land & Property Frontages

At their meeting on the 2nd July 2013, Members received an item titled 'Managing Litter on Private Land & Property Frontages'. The item was used to provide Members with a briefing on how Cardiff Council manages litter on private land and property frontages in the city. The item considered the scale of the problem, the legal position and the processes followed in Cardiff. When evaluating the problem Members discussed some best practice examples, including the 'Eyesore Gardens Project' implemented by the London Borough of Barking & Dagenham. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- A Member suggested that the creation of a byelaw could be effective in speeding up the process of removing litter from private land. She was told that the Council had considered implementing a byelaw, however, when they approached the Welsh Government they were told that this would not be possible as a bye law cannot be put in place when suitable legislation already exists to tackle the problem. The Cabinet Member for the Environment agreed to provide Members with a copy of the letter.
- Members commented that students were responsible for many instances of litter being left on property frontages in the city centre. Cardiff University has the ambition to make it into the list of the world's top 100 universities. The Committee welcomed this ambition; however, they felt that an important aspect of driving the prospects of the university forward involved providing a pleasant environment to enhance the student experience.

Following the meeting the Chair of the Committee wrote to the Vice Chancellor expressing the concerns of the Committee in relation to student litter problems. The letter asked for tougher action to be taken against students who allow litter to build up on private land and suggested that a zero tolerance towards litter message is delivered to all students who decide to study in the city.

- Members noted that sometimes there appeared to be confusion about who the Council targeted when trying to have waste removed from private land. The Committee felt that responsibility for the property fell to the landlord, and recommended that in future the Council should deal firmly with landlords who fail to address the problems caused by their tenants.
- Members encouraged the Council to engage with the universities at a senior level to address the problem of litter on private land and property frontages. They should ask the universities to make more of an effort to communicate the problems to their students and where appropriate to take firm action to resolve the problem.
- The Council should be more proactive and do what it can to speed up the process of removal of litter on private land. It currently takes a minimum of a month to deal with difficult cases. By reviewing the legislation used to resolve the problem the time taken to remove such litter could potentially be reduced to seven days, for example, Section 4 – Prevention of Damage by Pests Act 1949 (Harbourage).

Introduction & Implementation of ‘CarbonCulture’ in Cardiff

At their meeting on the 2nd July 2013, Members received an item titled ‘Introduction & Implementation of Carbon Culture in Cardiff’. The item was used to provide Members with a briefing on the implementation of the new ‘CarbonCulture’ scheme recently adopted by Cardiff Council to help monitor energy consumption. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members were very encouraged by the potential of the ‘CarbonCulture’ system that was recently introduced to Cardiff. They were very pleased that Members, staff and the public are now able to go online and view the

amount of gas and electricity being used in most Council buildings. It was felt that the 'CarbonCulture' system would encourage staff to reduce energy consumption which in turn would reduce expenditure on energy and lower the Council's carbon footprint.

- Members were keen to visit the 'CarbonCulture' website to see how it worked. They were very interested in its ability to review the data for buildings in which they had particular interest. I would, therefore, be grateful if you could arrange for officers to provide a link for the Cardiff Council section of the 'CarbonCulture' website.
- Members could see the potential that the 'CarbonCulture' system has for saving energy and reducing the Council's carbon footprint. They also saw that the system has the same potential for businesses and partner organisations in Cardiff. The Committee recommended that the scheme should be promoted to businesses and partner organisations in Cardiff; it was felt that this could help reduce the city's overall energy consumption and carbon footprint.

Cardiff Real Nappy Bank – Briefing Report

At their meeting on the 5th September 2013, Members received an item titled 'Briefing Report – Cardiff Real Nappy Bank'. The item was used as an information briefing to provide Members with a summary of the Cardiff Real Nappy Bank; how it was established; the work it undertakes; resources available and its future objectives.

School Traffic Safety

At their meeting on the 8th October 2013, Members received an item titled 'School Traffic Safety'. The item was used to provide Members with a briefing on the work currently being undertaken to better manage school traffic safety in Cardiff. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- A Councillor explained that there were schools in Radyr which he felt would benefit from school safety zones; particularly as they are close to busy roads. He accepted that the process had to remain criteria driven and

was interested in finding out how the score for these would compare against recently implemented schemes. Members agreed with this and asked for scores to be calculated for schemes implemented this year and for the Radyr schools.

- The Committee asked for information on how many of the schools in Cardiff had travel plans and if there were any examples of good school travel planning in the city. Members felt that this information should be circulated to all school governors in city to encourage them to duplicate this best practice.
- Members and officers engaged in a brief debate on the merits and costs of school safety and 20 mph zones. They agreed that there was a limited budget for implementing school safety zones which meant that a maximum of three or four schemes could be commissioned each year. As only 50 schools in Cardiff currently have school safety zones it was concluded that at the current rate it will take almost 20 years to provide each school with a school safety zone. Members were told that it was much quicker and cheaper to implement 20 mph zones in areas around schools. They felt that there was merit in evaluating how successful these could be in terms of improving traffic safety near schools. The Committee concluded that if it can be determined that 20 mph zones around schools improve road traffic safety then the Council should consider implementing these around all schools in the city.

Cardiff – An Energy Resilient City?

At their meeting on the 10th December 2013, Members received an item titled ‘Cardiff – An Energy Resilient City?’ The item was used to provide Members with a briefing on a wide range of local energy issues which have an impact on Cardiff, these included:

- Current local energy resources;
- Potential to increase local energy production;
- What an energy resilient city might look like and if this can be replicated in Cardiff;

- The energy related aims of One Planet Cardiff and associated projects, for example, the Renewable Energy Cooperative Business and generation of affordable energy for people in Cardiff.

Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members were interested in the performance of the 'Archimedes Wheel' mechanism to be used at the Radyr Weir hydro power scheme. They asked for the appropriate technical information on the mechanism to be provided.
- Members were interested in 'Energy Prospectus' which the Council is currently developing and asked for a copy of this document when it becomes available. They hoped that it would provide a better indication of the scale of income that the Council could generate from potential and current energy projects in the city; in particular they hoped that it would highlight how the Council could reach a £5 million per annum income from energy target by 2017.
- A Member commented that when the Council develops large projects it is often guilty of being "energy stupid" because of short term financial constraints, for example, spending millions of pounds on a new leisure centre but electing not to add in solar panels to warm up the pool water. In the short term it saves the Council money, however, in the long term it will cost the Council a fortune. He suggested that some type of mechanism should be put in place to ensure that this practice stops. The committee asked the Environment Directorate to confirm if any such mechanism is currently being used.

Income Generation from Recycling

At their meeting on the 10th December 2013, Members received an item titled 'Income Generation from Recycling'. The item was used to provide Members with a briefing on income generated by the Council for the recycling and handling of recycled materials. The item considered a number of areas including:

- Levels of recycling in Cardiff;

- Levels of recycling related income;
- The impact that recycling has on the Council budget;
- Other major challenges facing Cardiff in relation to recycling.

Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- The recycled materials income shortfall at the Materials Reclamation Facility was a concern. Members asked for regular updates on the matter in future particularly as the long term future of the Materials Reclamation Facility is unclear.
- Members were concerned at the potential impact that the Household Waste Recycling Centre – Service Redesign will have on recycling.
- Members were unsure how cardboard should be presented and collected; they felt that the approach needs to be simple, clear and effective. They asked that when the waste strategy is updated the Council should review the process for dealing with cardboard as it is one of the more profitable recyclable materials.
- The Welsh Government is due to provide some guidance on how and when kerbside sort should be applied in Wales; this follows on from a recent judicial review into the matter. Members have asked for an update on the matter once the information is available.
- Some Members felt that the application of kerbside sort in some wards in Cardiff would be impractical, for example, language and cultural barriers could create difficulties resulting in low recycling levels.
- The Council generated an income of £1,467,408 from recycled materials during 2012/13. Despite this high income the Council only has one officer working on a part time basis to manage the sale of recycled materials. Members feel that this is insufficient and that in order to maximise income the Council should employ at least one officer on a full time basis to manage recycled material sales.

Alternative delivery model for the Hayes Public Conveniences - Briefing Paper

At their meeting on the 11th March 2013, Members received an item titled

'Alternative delivery model for the Hayes Public Conveniences - Briefing Paper'. The item was used to provide Members with information about the alternative delivery model for the Hayes Public Conveniences. Following the item the main Member comment was that Members welcomed the item as a good news story; it was an example of how the Council can maintain services through partnership working in the current financial climate.

Greener Grangetown – Delivery Plans

At their meeting on the 8th April 2014, Members received an item titled 'Greener Grangetown – Delivery Plans'. The item was used to provide Members with some background on the Greener Grangetown project and to consider the plans which have been put in place for delivery of the scheme. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- They were particularly impressed that the project is unique to Cardiff and that it is being delivered by in-house expertise. The idea that the project will put Cardiff at the forefront of sustainable drainage is something that Cardiff Council should take pride in.
- The Committee were pleased to hear that the Council will be running a detailed and thorough consultation exercise on the project. They were assured that the key issue of parking will be a central theme of the consultation exercise and that local resident input will shape the final design of the scheme.
- While the Greener Grangetown project is unique, the Members were told about a project run by Welsh Water Dwr Cymru in Llanelli which did use some similar sustainable drainage techniques. The Committee felt that the Council should evaluate the implementation and delivery of the Llanelli project and apply the lessons learnt where appropriate to Greener Grangetown.

Closure and aftercare of Lamby Way landfill site and continued aftercare of the Ferry Road closed landfill site

At their meeting on the 11th March 2014, Members received an item titled

'Closure & Aftercare of Lamby Way Landfill Site & Continued Aftercare of Ferry Road Closed Landfill Site'. The item was used to provide Members with a briefing on the impact of the closure of Lamby Way landfill site and continued aftercare of the closed Ferry Road landfill site. It was also used to inform Members of the interim arrangements for service delivery between the closure of the Lamby Way landfill site and the start of the Project Gwyrdd contract for residual waste. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members were encouraged at the work due to be undertaken to ensure a safe and compliant closure of the Lamby Way landfill site. There was some concern at the £200,000 maintenance costs required for each of the next 60 years, however, they felt that placing a solar farm on the Lamby Way site was an excellent idea which could potentially help offset this ongoing cost.

Cardiff Council – Implementation of a Zero Tolerance Approach to Waste

At their meeting on the 5th September 2013, Members received an item titled 'Cardiff Council – Implementation of a zero tolerance approach to litter'. The item was used to provide Members with a summary of the work that Cardiff Council has undertaken to implement a 'Zero Tolerance' approach towards litter in the city and consider any future initiatives. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- The Committee were pleased by the Council's implementation of the zero tolerance approach to waste; in particular they were encouraged by some of the data provided which highlighted that enforcement activity had significantly increased in Cardiff.
- Officers explained that the Council was involved with a court case on the 6th September 2013 which would effectively test the method of prosecution for placing bin bags out on the wrong day. The Committee asked for a summary of the outcome of the case and the implications it will have for litter in Cardiff.

Briefing on the results of the Waste Strategy Consultation Exercise

At their meeting on the 14th January 2014 Members received an item titled 'Briefing on the results of the waste strategy consultation exercise'. The item was used to update Members on the results of the 'Waste Strategy Survey'. It allowed them to consider resident views on the potential future options and how these results may influence the creation of a new Recycling Waste Strategy. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- The Members welcomed the fact that public consultation had taken place to support the development of the Council's Waste Strategy, however, they questioned whether the number of responses received was representative of the whole city. On that basis they were reluctant to use the public consultation as the basis for policy decisions. They requested that the Committee received a breakdown of the demographics of the respondents, including age profiles and the electoral wards represented in the findings.
- The Committee asked for a future update on the Waste Strategy for Cardiff prior to its implementation. Members felt that assurances were needed to demonstrate that what is being proposed can, and had worked elsewhere. They hoped that mistakes made in previous Waste Strategies for Cardiff would not be repeated.

Position Paper on Metro proposals and implications for Cardiff

At their meeting on the 14th January 2014 Members received an item titled 'Position Paper on Metro proposals and implications for Cardiff '. The item briefed Members on proposals for the Cardiff Capital Region Metro and its strategic implications for Cardiff. It asked for Member endorsement of the proposals and their approval for officers to engage with Welsh Government and other key stakeholders to progress delivery of the Metro Plan. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- Members of the Committee were pleased to note the long term vision of this project and the commitment it displays to supporting the development of the Cardiff Capital Region. They recognised that the full completion of the project would take many years and considerable funding to undertake, but felt that it was imperative that the initiative is completed.

Bus Routes & Subsidies

At their meeting on the 8th May 2014, Members received an item titled 'Bus Routes & Subsidies'. This briefed Members on the contribution Cardiff Council makes to bus routes in the city with particular reference on how it allocates subsidies for bus routes in the city and surrounding area. In doing this the item considered recent changes to bus routes and future proposals to shape bus provision in Cardiff. Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- The Committee found the Canton Parking changes interesting and will consider reviewing the impact of the parking changes at a future meeting.
- The Committee will be inviting representatives from Cardiff Bus to a future meeting to talk Members through the decision making process used to determine the viability of bus routes across Cardiff.
- Members encouraged the City of Cardiff Council and Cardiff Bus to place a greater social impact weighting into the decision making process for allocation of bus route subsidies and continuation of bus route services.
- Members asked for the results of the Bus Network Study once they become available.

Ensuring High Standards of Food Safety in Cardiff

At their meeting on the 8th May 2014, Members received an item titled 'Ensuring High Standards of Food Safety in Cardiff'. This briefed Members on how the City of Cardiff Council ensures that high food safety standards are adhered to in the city. In doing so the item considered the Council's statutory

obligations; the resources allocated to meet the statutory responsibilities; the scale of the task and the future challenges facing food safety in Cardiff.

Following the item the main Member comments and observations were:

- They congratulated the staff in the Food & Feed Service for the work that they undertook in 2013/14. Members were impressed that despite budget reductions for the service and increased workloads they still managed to complete the majority of their inspection programme.
- Members were very surprised that food businesses do not have to pay any type of licensing or registration fee for food inspections; they agreed during the way forward that such fees would go a long way to addressing some of the required budget savings. They suggested that it would be worthwhile approaching a number the major food retailers in the city to ask if they would be willing to make a donation to help protect the food inspection budget.
- They asked for an update on the City Analyst Laboratory once the procurement exercise is complete along with a summary of the implications that the exercise will have on the service.

RECOMMENDED FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items for inclusion on the work programme, and can also suggest any new issues which may be of interest to the Committee. The following issues have been suggested as potential items for inclusion in the 2014 - 15 work programme:

- Resident Parking Permit Scheme
- Carbon Culture
- City of Cardiff Council - Energy Prospectus
- Waste Management Strategy (to include waste collections, enforcement, street sweeping and impact on recycling and the street scene)
- Outdoor Services – Alternative Delivery Models
- Planning Service Redesign
- Ward Based Cleansing Trials - Update
- New Parking strategy for Cardiff
- Cabinet Reponse - Problem & Nuisance Parking in Cardiff
- Cabinet Response - Cycling in Cardiff's Parks
- Horse Management
- Highways Maintenance - State of Highways Report
- City Analyst - Procurement Update
- Strategic Bus Strategy
- Masterplan for Butetown
- Cycling in Cardiff's Parks
- Student Letting Boards
- Cycling Strategy
- Canton Parking Trial
- Cardiff Bus – Bus Route Viability Decision Making Process
- Walkable Neighbourhoods
- Cardiff's Parking Strategy

- Prosiect Gwyrdd - Update
- Organic Waste Treatment Procurement – Update
- Performance Indicator Review
- Budget Briefings – In Advance of the 2015/16 Budget Setting Process
- Draft Corporate Plan – 2014/17
- Draft Budget Proposals – 2015/16
- Performance Monitoring
- Cardiff Dogs Home - Future Operating Models / Options
- Planning Enforcement Review

Scrutiny Services, The City & County of Cardiff,
Room 243, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff CF10 4UW
Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk
© 2014 The City & County of Cardiff

s c r u t i n y



**Policy Review and Performance
Scrutiny Committee**

Annual Report 2013–2014

June 2014



The City of Cardiff Council

Contents

Contents.....	2
POLICY REVIEW & PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE	3
Chair’s Foreword.....	4
Introduction	6
Work programme overview	7
Member Development	10
Inspection and Assessment of Committee.....	11
Increasing Partnership Scrutiny.....	11
Highlights of 2013/14.....	12
Local Development Plan – Deposit Plan inquiry	12
Information Governance inquiry.....	13
Budget Scrutiny	14
2014/15 Budget Strategy	14
2014/15 Budget Strategy – Directorate Budget Briefings.....	16
Budget Monitoring 2013/14 – Central Transport Services.....	17
Budget Monitoring 2013/14 - Facilities Management	18
Budget 2014/15 – Proposals for A Review Of Council Grant Funding	19
Budget 2014/15 – Review Of Council Grant Funding – Advice Package Procurement	22
Draft Corporate Plan 2014 - 17.....	23
Performance Scrutiny	25
Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review Arrangements	25
Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review report	26
Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review – Cabinet response	28
Wales Audit Office Improvement Report and Letter	29
2013/14 Performance Monitoring.....	31
Performance Benchmarking.....	31
Performance Review.....	32
Review of the Post of Chief Executive	33
Cardiff Council Web Refresh Project	35
Revised Redeployment Policy	36
Social Inclusion.....	37
Organisational Change Programme	38
Community Hubs Proposals	40
Public Sector Asset Management.....	40
Future work programme opportunities for 2014/15	42

POLICY REVIEW & PERFORMANCE SCRUTINY COMMITTEE



[Councillor Nigel Howells](#)
(Chairperson)



[Councillor Phil Bale](#)
(From June 2013 to March 2014)



[Councillor Garry Hunt](#)



[Councillor Sam Knight](#)



[Councillor Kathryn Lloyd](#)



[Councillor Mark McGarry](#)
(From April 2014 onwards)



[Councillor Jim Murphy](#)



[Councillor Gretta Marshall](#)
(From June 2013 to May 2014)



[Councillor Adrian Robson](#)



[Councillor David Walker](#)

Chair's Foreword

Firstly, I would like to thank those Members who have sat on the Committee over the course of the past year for their hard work and dedication. I would also like to thank the many witnesses who have appeared before us to help us formulate our recommendations to the Cabinet; their expertise has been invaluable.

Throughout the year the Committee has aimed to contribute to service improvement through robust pre-decision scrutiny; vigorous budget and performance monitoring; and by providing key 'critical friend' challenge of policy. With such wide-ranging terms of reference we have endeavoured to undertake a strong corporate role, considering the assessments of external bodies such as the Wales Audit Office in terms of its Annual Improvement Report and the Welsh Local Government Association in terms of its Peer Review, as well as hearing from key partners and stakeholders such as Trade Union colleagues and the Cardiff Third sector Council. Considerable time has been devoted to review of budget and performance issues, as well as to considering the impact of policy development on the delivery of services to citizens.

It is clear from the comments of the WLGA Peer Review (more of which below) that the value of scrutiny and its importance to the democratic process is recognised in Cardiff. However it is also starkly apparent that increasingly demanding times lie ahead for the City of Cardiff and that Scrutiny must play a central role in driving improvement and ensuring the best for Cardiff's citizens.

The Committee is ready to build on the positive relationship which has developed with the Cabinet and the Council's new Senior Management Team over the past year, to continue to provide a vital check and balance to the Council. Building on the work of the past year, testing the delivery of the Organisational Development programme and its potential impact on citizens and employees; the development of the 2014/15 Budget Proposals and what they will mean for ongoing service delivery; and shaping how Cardiff can do better when compared against its peers, are likely to be strong themes in 2014/15.

I commend the 2013/14 Annual Report of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee to you.



Councillor Nigel Howells
Chair, Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee

Introduction

1. The Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee has a corporate policy and performance overview responsibility. In its examination of service performance and policy development across a range of corporate services, it is central to the Council's governance arrangements.
2. The Committee's terms of reference, agreed by Full Council on 29 May 2014, are:
 - To scrutinise, monitor and review the overall operation of the Cardiff Programme for Improvement and the effectiveness of the general implementation of the Council's policies, aims and objectives, including:

Council Business Management and Constitutional Issues	Cardiff Local Development
Cardiff Council Corporate Plan	Equalities
Strategic Policy Development	Finance and Corporate Grants
Strategic Programmes	Organisational Development
Community Planning & Vision Forum	E-Government
Voluntary Sector Relations	Information and Communication Technology
Citizen Engagement & Consultation	Council Property
Corporate Communications	Commissioning and Procurement
Contact Centre Services and Service Access	Carbon Management
International Policy	Legal Services

- To scrutinise, monitor and review the effectiveness of the Council's systems of financial control and administration and use of human resources;
- To assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies

and quasi-departmental non governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery;

- To report to an appropriate Cabinet or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures which may enhance Council performance in this area.

3. As well as performing its corporate overview function, the Committee's Terms of Reference allow for it to consider specific areas of the organisation's current structure in depth. This largely comprises:

- The **Resources Directorate** including Finance; Legal Services; Human Resources; Commissioning & Procurement; ICT Central Transport Services and Facilities Management; Performance and Information Management;
- The **County Clerk and Monitoring Officer Directorate** including Scrutiny, Democratic Services, Member Services, Media and Communications;
- Parts of the **Economic Development Directorate** in terms of the Council's asset management and international policy functions;
- Parts of the **Communities, Housing and Customer Service Directorate** including the Council's customer services, consultation, voluntary sector relations and equalities functions.

Work programme overview

4. This Annual Report covers the work of the Committee between June 2013 and May 2014. The work programme has been varied and responsive to the Council's priorities throughout the year, although with a clear focus on the Council's performance management and budgetary pressures. The Committee has aimed to undertake as much pre-decision scrutiny as possible, as well as helping to drive improvement through scrutiny of the Council's response to external assessments.
5. The items considered by the Committee are listed in the 'Programme Overview' below, whilst those areas of greatest impact are reported in 'Highlights of 2013/14' from page 11 onwards.

6. During the 2013/14 municipal year the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee held 13 meetings. This included 11 standard Committees and two special meetings called to consider items of some urgency. This culminated in 28 letters to the Cabinet and Senior Management Team sharing the Committee's comments, concerns and recommendations following the scrutiny of items.
7. In addition to its regular full Committee meetings, the Committee has led on the last stage of a task and finish inquiry examining the Draft Deposit Local Development Plan, and will soon publish the findings of its inquiry into Information Governance.
8. In reviewing the year it is notable that the Committee has as far as possible concentrated its efforts on pre-decision scrutiny, but it has scrutinised a wide variety of areas, including:

Call-In – Where a Member invokes the Call-in procedure under the Council's constitution, to review a Cabinet decision prior to implementation. The Committee did not consider any Call-Ins in 2013/14

Inquiries – Where the Committee has undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. In 2013/14 this included:

- Local Development Plan Deposit Plan task and finish inquiry (July – October 2013)
- Information Governance inquiry (December 2014 –).

Joint Scrutiny Work – Where the Committee has joined together with one or more scrutiny committees to examine a topic of a crosscutting nature to enable collective consideration of the issues or preparation for individual scrutiny. This has included:

- Community Hubs Proposals (Joint Sub Committee of the Policy Review and Performance, Community and Adult Services and Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committees).

Policy Review – Where the Committee has considered the implementation and impact of policies, providing the Cabinet with Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required. In 2013/14 the Committee considered the following subjects:

- Budget Strategy 2014/15 (September 2013)
- Updated Budget Strategy 2014/15 (November 2013)
- Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment Arrangements (5 June 2013)
- Wales Audit Office Annual Improvement Report & Letter (15 October 2013 – special meeting)
- Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review Arrangements (5 June 2013)
- Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review report (15 October 2013 – special meeting)
- Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review Cabinet response (26 November 2013 and 7 January 2014)
- Budget 2014/15 – Directorate Budget Briefings (29 October and 26 November 2013)
- Attendance & Wellbeing Policy – six month review (4 March 2014).

Policy Development – Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes. In 2013/14 these included:

- Customer Services – Cardiff Council Web Refresh project (June 2013)
- Review of Council Grants – Advice Package Procurement (29 October 2013)
- Performance Benchmarking (4 March 2014)
- Cardiff Council website – governance arrangements (1 April 2014)
- Performance Review (1 April 2014)
- Social Inclusion (6 May 2014).

Pre-Decision – Where the Committee has evaluated and commented on policy proposals before they go to the Cabinet. In 2013/14 this included:

- Review of the Post of Chief Executive (June 2013 – special meeting)
- Budget 2014/15 - Proposals for a Review of Council Grants (1 October 2013)

- Revised Redeployment Policy (26 November 2013)
- Draft 2014/15 Budget Proposals (13 February 2014)
- Draft 2014-17 Corporate Plan (13 February 2014)
- Organisational Change programme (6 May 2014).

Monitoring – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council’s performance in implementing actions previously agreed. In 2013/14 this included:

- Quarterly Performance reports (Outturn 2012/13 - 9 July 2013, Quarter 1 2013/14 - 29 October 2013, Quarter 2 2013/14 – 7 January 2014, Quarter 3 – 1 April 2014)
- Budget Monitoring reports (Outturn 2012/13 – 9 July 2013; Month 3 2013/14 – 29 October 2013, Month 6 2013/14- 7 January 2014, Month 9 2013/14/ - 4 March 2014)
- Budget 2013/14 - Central Transport Services (7 January 2014)
- Budget Monitoring 2013/14 - Facilities Management (7 January 2014)
- Council Tax Single Person Discount inquiry update (7 January 2014).

Briefing Information - Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject which comes under its terms of reference. In 2013/14 this included:

- Improvement Framework (12 September 2013)
- Audit Committee minutes
- Corporate Risk Register (7 January 2014)
- Annual Complaints Report (7 January 2014)
- Public Sector Asset Management (7 January 2014).

Member Development

9. As Scrutiny is a Member-led function, and its success is closely linked to the capacity and capabilities of the Members who sit on Scrutiny Committees, the Scrutiny Team works closely with colleagues across the Council to provide a continuous range of opportunities for Members to build or refresh their Scrutiny skills, and extend their knowledge and insight into a range of issues relevant to

their Scrutiny role. Members of the Committee have actively participated in training sessions, briefings, and awareness-raising sessions. The Scrutiny development and training programme is an ongoing process and further opportunities will be identified to help Members in fulfilling the full span of their duties as an elected representative and community champion.

Inspection and Assessment of Committee

10. The work of the Committee has been assessed by the Wales Audit Office as part of their Corporate Assessment of Cardiff Council, as well as by the Welsh Local Government Association as part of the Peer Review which was commissioned by the Council. The former has yet to report, but the WLGA team was “impressed” by Cardiff’s scrutiny, feeling that there is “much other authorities can learn from the way scrutiny is undertaken in Cardiff Council”.

Increasing Partnership Scrutiny

11. Welsh Government has commissioned a range of studies in recent years (including the Beecham Review and the more recent Simpson Review) which have substantially advanced thinking on the role of collaboration in public service administration.

12. Cardiff was the first local authority in Wales to introduce scrutiny to its Local Service Board in 2009. Following the successful evaluation of its award-winning pilot LSB Scrutiny Panel, Cardiff continued to resource its successor Cardiff Partnership Board Scrutiny Panel in 2013/14. Including the Chair of the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee, the Panel played an important role in scrutinising the effectiveness of the Cardiff Partnership Board. It has helped to optimise the implementation of the ten-year “What Matters” integrated strategy for advancing wellbeing across seven key outcomes for people living in, working in or visiting our city.

Highlights of 2013/14

Local Development Plan – Deposit Plan inquiry

Context

13. Following the deposit of Cardiff's Local Development Plan (LDP) in April 2009, it was submitted to the Welsh Assembly Government for examination in November 2009. In view of issues raised by the Inspectors examining the Plan, and following agreement from the Welsh Assembly Government, the Council withdrew the LDP from the Examination in March 2010 and commenced work on preparing a new Plan.

14. Scrutiny has considered the Council's progress towards securing an LDP at each stage of the Plan's development, via a joint task and finish group comprising volunteers from all five scrutiny committees, led by this Committee. Following consideration of the Draft Preferred Strategy and the Draft Masterplanning General Principles in the 2012/13 municipal year, the Group considered the Draft Deposit Plan, considering it against the 'ten tests of soundness'.

Scrutiny Outcomes

15. The Task and Finish group recommended that:

- The public consultation be made as accessible as possible and that communication with both new and existing communities should be further considered in order to create an open dialogue;
- Monitoring arrangements should be established via the provision of an Annual Monitoring Report to this Committee;
- The Cabinet should work with partners to ensure appropriate phasing of delivery of community facilities and infrastructure;
- A Public Sector Asset Management Strategy via the Cardiff Partnership Board should be progressed;
- Transport proposals should be improved in discussion with Welsh Government and other partners with regards to a regional transport solution, and that early

communication should take place with those residents who may be affected by any regional transport solutions;

- Site specific masterplans should take into account integrated facilities which make sustainable transport solutions viable, and ensure that they specify how affordable housing will be placed within each site;
- Members should be fully engaged in the development of the necessary policies and Supplementary Planning Guidance to support the delivery of the LDP;
- The Cabinet should pursue a regional solution for Gypsy and Traveller provision;
- A further inquiry should be established to consider the implications of the Community Infrastructure Levy and changes to Section 106 funding in more depth.

Cabinet response

16. *The Committee is awaiting a formal response.*

Information Governance inquiry

Context

17. At its January 2013 meeting, the Committee considered the Council's Corporate Risk Register, which sets out the key strategic risks faced by the Council. The Register identified Information Governance as one of these risks, citing the risk of 'a lack of clarity around information governance leaving the Council exposed to the Information Commissioner's intervention and financial penalties'. The Committee subsequently received a briefing from the Leader and Officers setting out the Council's framework, resources and policies for the management of information in March 2013. Having concerns about the level of risk posed to the Council, the Committee resolved to establish a task and finish inquiry to consider the issues in more depth. The Inquiry Group has to date heard from the Assistant Commissioner for Wales and her team from the Information Commissioner's Office, the Wales Audit Office, the Welsh Government and the WASPI (Wales Accord for the Sharing of Personal Information) Team. They have also visited the Council's internal

Records Centre and commissioned a review of the Council's information governance resources and processes.

Scrutiny Outcomes

18. The Task and Finish group will report in the near future.

Budget Scrutiny

19. As noted above, the Committee has maintained a strong focus on the Council's budget this year, in terms of both the Budget Strategy for 2014/15 and in undertaking robust monitoring of the implementation of the 2013/14 Budget. Members of the Committee have also taken a robust interest in developing and improving the Council's arrangements of the scrutiny of the budget in future years. Some of the details of their scrutiny activity are set out below.

2014/15 Budget Strategy

Context

20. The Committee discussed the 2014/15 Budget Strategy in September 2013 and an updated report in November 2013. The Strategy clearly set out the serious financial position which Cardiff Council faces. Based on indicative Welsh Government funding levels, a significant funding gap had been identified which the Council must close through savings, increases in Council Tax or through using the Council's reserves.

21. The Budget Strategy set out that savings could be business-process led savings, made from traditional directorate-based savings, or through policy-led drivers, including:

- Establishing new organisations to deliver services;
- Setting up or exploiting existing partnerships to deliver services;
- Identifying collaboration opportunities to deliver services;
- Exploiting opportunities to sell services or trade services;

- Consideration of whether to make or buy services as part of the wider consideration of commissioning and procurement;
- Consideration of reducing services or closing service provision.

22. In terms of the Council's future Capital Programme, the Budget Strategy made it clear that there was little scope for new schemes, given the financial pressures on the Council. New schemes would have to be self-financing over a prudent period of time; attract partner or grant support; be self-financing by releasing land and property or be unavoidable as a result of pressures.

Scrutiny outcomes

23. The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member for Finance and Economic

Development to:

- Request to be kept informed as business-process led changes were developed;
- Recommend that a holistic view of savings proposals must be taken, in order to consider the impact of savings from one directorate on the service pressures felt by others;
- Note that proposals were under development for reviewing the Council's grant funding to external bodies. The Committee welcomed the more timely approach which was being taken to ensure that third sector organisations had time to mitigate against likely funding cuts;
- Make a number of comments about the need to improve the Budget Scrutiny process. These comments focussed on the availability of information; the need for earlier scrutiny access to Budget Proposals; and an improved, accessible, consultation process, to allow citizens to comment about the Proposals from an informed position. The Committee particularly recommended that the results of budget consultation should be made available to all Scrutiny Committees to aid their consideration of the budget.

Cabinet response

24. *The Committee continued to work closely with the Cabinet as the 2014/15 Budget Proposals developed and has since scrutinised proposals to establish a three-year*

*Organisational Development programme to help meet the challenges it is facing.
Further details of this activity are included below.*

2014/15 Budget Strategy – Directorate Budget Briefings

Context

25. During the 2012/13 municipal year, the Committee was robust in recommending that improved information should be provided to Cardiff's Scrutiny Committees to enable strong scrutiny of the Cabinet's budget proposals and a fuller understanding of the context in which proposals were developed. All Scrutiny Committees received briefings from Cabinet Members and Directors in late autumn, setting out an overview of each Directorate including key budgetary and staffing information. Directors also informed Committees about the main challenges and opportunities facing their services.

26. Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee received briefings from the Corporate Director for Resources; the County Clerk and Monitoring Officer, the Director for Communities, Housing and Social Justice (regarding Customer Services, Third Sector relations and Equalities), and the Director for Economic Development regarding Strategic Estates and International Policy.

Scrutiny outcomes

27. The Chair wrote to the relevant Cabinet Members with a number of comments:

- The Committee welcomed the more rounded view of the budget which the Directorate Briefing Packs provided Members, feeling that it was useful preparation for the scrutiny of the final Budget Proposals;
- The Committee felt that all Directorates should address their Capital forecasting and slippage;
- The Committee noted that Directorates were investigating income opportunities;
- Members noted that decisions around budget transfers had been taken which would seem to subsidise some Directorate budgets;

- The Committee also queried decisions taken to delete some senior management posts.

Budget Monitoring 2013/14 – Central Transport Services

Context

28. As part of the Committee's strong focus on the Council's Budget this year, Members considered the Council's Central Transport Services section in some depth at its January 2014 meeting, in the context of the 2013/14 Month 6 Budget Monitoring report. Central Transport Services (CTS) was created in 2009 and is responsible for transport and vehicle provision within the Council. It is now part of the Resources Directorate. Budget Monitoring reports had highlighted CTS as a significant issue to the Council's monitoring position, with an overspend of over £1 million projected at Month 6, including significant shortfalls against the service's savings targets for the 2013/14 financial year. As a result of this risk to the Council's monitoring position, the 2014/15 Budget Strategy set out that, as significant savings proposals had been accepted from CTS in 2013/14, requiring further savings through efficiencies was deemed to be unreasonable.

29. The Committee discussed CTS in some depth with the Corporate Director – Resources and the Operational Manager Facilities Management (who was at that point undertaking a caretaker role for the service), receiving considerable background information in terms of the service's structures, overall budget, and performance, as well as regarding proposals to develop a business case for investigating the income opportunities.

Scrutiny Outcomes

30. The Cabinet Member for Finance, Business and the Local Economy had been unable to attend the meeting. The Committee wrote to him to:

- Express concern that some savings proposals relating to the service had been deemed to be entirely unachievable. Several of these had been assessed to be 'Amber/Green' in terms of achievability as they had gone through the 2013/14 budget development process and Members were concerned that the budget

assessment process seemed not to have provided Members with reliable information. Members had been informed at the meeting that a more rigorous assessment process was being put in place for 2015/16, which would include a 'planning' status showing whether there were detailed delivery plans in place for each saving proposal;

- Convey its positivity about the service's plans for the future, such as proposed Service Improvement initiatives;
- Request further details of the cost of officer mileage versus use of the council's pool cars;
- State that some members of the Committee had reservations about the viability of CTS becoming a Trading Company and its ability to compete with the private sector;
- Express concern about the service's recent move to a new facility at Coleridge Road on an invest to save basis, querying whether this investment would still pay off, should CTS move in a new direction. The Committee particularly hoped that lessons would be learnt in future and Invest to Save schemes would be subject to more rigorous assessment processes. Members later referred the issue of Invest to Save to the Audit Committee, during the Committee's consideration of the Draft Budget Proposals 2014/15.

Cabinet response

31. *The Cabinet Member for Finance and Economic Development, Councillor Russell Goodway, responded reiterating that the new 'planning status' assessment has been put in place for the development of 2014/15 Budget proposals. He also provided a further assessment of the costs of mileage and pool cars.*

Budget Monitoring 2013/14 - Facilities Management

Context

32. The Committee also focused on the Council's Facilities Management section at its January 2014 meeting, in the context of the 2013/14 Month 6 Budget Monitoring report. Facilities Management (FM) had been created in 2011 from a number of budgets previously disaggregated across the Council. The service manages

Council building in terms of maintenance, cleaning, and security. Similarly to Central Transport Services, discussed above, FM projected a high overspend at Month 6, of £924,000, mainly due to shortfalls in savings targets.

33. The Committee discussed FM with the Corporate Director – Resources and the Operational Manager Facilities Management receiving considerable background information in terms of the service’s structures, overall budget, and performance.

Scrutiny Outcomes

34. The Cabinet Member for Finance and Economic Development had been unable to attend the meeting. The Committee wrote to him to :

- Welcome the work which officers in Facilities Management were undertaking to develop a strategy for the future of the service;
- Note that developing a strategy was made more difficult because he had not given a public position on the future of the Council’s operational buildings and in particular on the future of County Hall;
- Query how the maintenance backlog on Council buildings could be effectively addressed without this public position; and
- Repeat its concern that the budget proposal assessment process had not been effective.

Cabinet response

35. *The Cabinet Member for Finance and Economic Development responded noting the Committee’s comments about the budget assessment process, reiterating that the new ‘planning status’ assessment has been put in place for the development of 2014/15 Budget proposals.*

Budget 2014/15 – Proposals for A Review Of Council Grant Funding

Context

36. The Committee met on 1 October 2013 for pre-decision scrutiny of proposals to review the Council’s grant funding to external bodies as part of the 2014/15 Budget

Strategy. Hearing from the Cabinet Member and officers, as well as the Chief Officer of the Cardiff Third Sector Council, the Committee was told that an initial assessment had established that at that time the Council awarded £2.7 million in 123 separate grants to 94 organisations. The draft report which the Committee considered set out that while many were being used to deliver key services, others were awarded on a historic basis and a link to strategic need to alignment to policy was often difficult to establish.

37. The report therefore made a number of recommendations about the future of grant funding, which would be communicated and consulted upon with affected organisations. These would be subject to final agreement with the Budget Proposals report in February 2014. It was proposed to split grants into several categories:

- Those delivering key services would continue at 2013/14 funding levels, split into three separate packages which would be commissioned in future;
- Those to infrastructure and key equality organisations would continue but with a 10% funding cut;
- A number of grants would also cease as of 1 April 2014. Equality Impact Assessments had been partly undertaken by Council officers and would be completed in consultation with affected organisations;
- Finally, some grants which had been identified by directorates as delivering strategically important services would be retained within directorate base budgets and be commissioned for service-specific purposes where appropriate.

38. The report also set out proposals to establish a neighbourhood fund of £180,000 for Cardiff's six neighbourhood partnership areas. Applications would need to secure the 'sponsorship' of a ward Member and outline the evidence of need in the area as well as the intended outcomes of the funding.

Scrutiny outcomes

39. The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member for Communities, Housing and Social Justice to:

- Welcome the longer period allowed for consultation with recipients of grant funding, having been concerned during the 2013/14 budget setting process that Third Sector groups had not been allowed sufficient time;
- Welcome the shift towards an outcome focus;
- Request full engagement with Scrutiny as the commissioning approach developed to ensure that it would deliver as intended;
- Seek to understand the costs involved in administering these changes, as the Committee had some concerns that increased administration could make the savings negligible;
- Recommend that the operation of the neighbourhood fund should be as transparent as possible and to request further details of the allocation criteria. The Committee was also concerned that smaller organisations should be supported through the application process;
- Request the results of consultation with the Third Sector on Equality Impact Assessments prior to scrutiny of the final budget proposals;
- Recommend that it was made clear that the 'reserve' referred to in the 'advice' procurement package was very much a contingency;
- Request further details regarding the decision to transfer the entirety of two grants into directorate budgets without being subject to a cut.

Cabinet response

40. *The Cabinet Member for Communities, Housing and Social Justice responded that she shared the Committee's concerns about ensuring that organisations had the maximum possible time to plan for potential funding reductions. She confirmed that workshops would be held with current providers in order to develop the commissioning approach. Business Wales would help to deliver the workshops, one of which a Committee member later attended. The responses also stated that there would be no additional costs incurred in terms of administering the new approach to grants. The Cabinet Member confirmed details regarding the administration of the neighbourhood fund. With regards to the 'reserve' the Cabinet*

Member agreed that the Committee's point would be clearly communicated. She also stated that the full transfer of two grants into directorate budgets would still leave those grants subject to savings requirements as part of the usual budget process.

Budget 2014/15 – Review Of Council Grant Funding – Advice Package Procurement

Context

41. Following on from the Committee's consideration of the proposals to Review the Council's Grant Funding arrangements, the Committee considered the procurement arrangements for the Advice Package at its 29 October 2013 meeting. The scope of the scrutiny was to consider the procurement and consultation arrangements. Members were informed that a two-year Advice contract, covering income maximisation advice, budgeting and debt, housing issues, family & employment law, immigration, equalities and discrimination, and consumer issues. This would bring commissioned advice services under one supplier to ensure that the service was 'consistent, high quality and cost effective'. Subcontracting would be possible to enable smaller providers to participate. The contract would be procured to a value of £500,000 with a small reserve for unforeseen need. The Committee was informed that independent advice and support would be provided by Business Wales and supplier workshops would be held to give providers a chance to inform the final specification and network.

Scrutiny outcomes

42. The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member for Community & Neighbourhood Regeneration and Social Justice to:
- Welcome the approach which had been developed to include suppliers in the development of the specification. The Committee requested further details so that a Member of the Committee could attend one of the supplier workshops;
 - Note that should service pressures require further funding this would require a financial pressures bid through the budget-setting process;

- Highlight potential issues with subcontracting under a single supplier contract and recommend that the Council very clearly set out its expectation to be informed when subcontractors are used;
- Emphasise that the monitoring of the contract and the selection of appropriate performance indicators will be vital to ensure that outcomes for citizens are delivered;
- Express the concern of some Members that it was possible that these services would be brought in-house at the end of the contract period;
- Reiterate that the Committee wanted to see the results of the overall Grants consultation to aid its consideration of the final 2014/15 Budget Proposals.

Cabinet response

43. *The Cabinet Member replied noting the Committee's comments and offering to report back as the contract process went forward. One Member of the Committee later attended a supplier workshop to hear from providers and Business Wales. Following a change in Cabinet structure, the Committee received a further letter from the Cabinet Member for Health, Housing and Wellbeing in April 2014 to update Members on progress. The supplier workshop had been held in November 2014, at which the way forward for the procurement of advice service had been set out. Comments on the principles were requested, but none were received by the deadline. Further consultation took place on the detail of the services to be commissioned, which led to changes in the services being commissioned and comments were used to inform the drafting of the specification.*

Draft Corporate Plan 2014 - 17

Context

44. The Committee considered the draft refresh of the Council's Corporate Plan 2014-17 at its February 2014 meeting. When the Committee had considered the 2013-17 Corporate Plan, Members had made a number of comments about the measurability of its outcomes and the suitability of the milestones included in terms of their consistency, measurability and definitions. Many of these points were later picked up by the Wales Audit Office and Welsh Local Government Association.

The Committee had also recommended that further input should have been sought from the citizens of Cardiff.

Scrutiny outcomes

45. The Committee wrote to the Leader to:

- Express concern that the Corporate Plan had not been available in time to be sent out with all Scrutiny Committee papers and that the accompanying detailed 'Delivery Plan' had also arrived late. Members of the Committee were clear in their view that the drafting of the Corporate Plan should be done earlier in the year in order to ensure proper scrutiny consideration;
- Emphasise that the Corporate Plan should be drafted with several audiences in mind – the public, partners, officers and regulatory bodies for instance – and state that they were not convinced that this was currently the case;
- Recommend that the Corporate Plan should set out more clearly the difficult choices which the Council would have to make in the medium- to long-term;
- Suggest that although the Corporate Plan had improved, there were still improvements to be made in terms of the measures it contained.
- State that the Committee was sceptical as to whether the Plan clearly set out the links between the Corporate Plan, the Cardiff 'What Matters' integrated partnership strategy;
- Emphasise that the Council's performance management framework should be addressed as a matter of urgency;
- Request a date to be confirmed urgently when Directorate Delivery Plans would be ready for scrutiny.

Cabinet response

46. *The Committee has since considered proposals to review the Council's performance management arrangements, further details of which are below. The Committee will consider the Directorate Delivery Plans at its June and July 2014 meetings.*

Performance Scrutiny

47. Following on from considerable activity in 2012/13, the Committee has made consideration of the Council's performance and performance management arrangements a key priority in its work programme for 2013/14, noting that this was an area subsequently highlighted by the Wales Audit Office and the Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review. The Committee has monitored the Council's corporate performance reports on a regular basis, as well as using performance information when scrutinising specific services in more depth, such as during its consideration of Central Transport Services and Facilities Management in January 2014.

Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review Arrangements

Context

48. In May 2013, the Cabinet approved a proposal to invite the Welsh Local Government Association (WLGA) to undertake an independent Peer Review of Cardiff Council. This would provide the Cabinet and senior managers, including newly-appointed directors, with additional 'critical friend' input in terms of the Council's strengths and areas for development, as well as the risks it was facing. The Committee was briefed on these arrangements in June 2013 and was told that a team of reviewers would be brought together, comprising of a Leader or Chief Executive of a comparable local authority, and specialists on corporate working and service delivery. The Review, the cost of which would be met by the WLGA, would comprise of both a desk-based review and onsite engagement with Members and officers.

Scrutiny outcomes

49. The Committee wrote to the Leader to:

- Request details of the Peer Review team, as these had not been confirmed at the time the Committee met;

- Recommend that the Review should ensure that the views of customers were taken into account;
- Recommend that Trade Union colleagues should be fully engaged in the review process and not simply treated as a stakeholder group; and
- Request that the Committee receive the results of the Review.

Cabinet response

50. *The Leader, Councillor Heather Joyce, wrote to the Chair confirming that the Committee's comments regarding engagement with customers and Trade Unions to the WLGA to take into account when planning their activities. She also confirmed that Scrutiny consideration of the results of the Review was an important part of the Council's overall consideration.*

Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review report

Context

51. The Committee next considered the Peer Review once the WLGA's report had been formally presented to the Cabinet on 10 October 2013, at a special meeting on 15 October 2013. The Review highlighted a number of areas where the Council needed to develop, including internal communications; senior management capacity; the connection between the Council's priorities and those set out in service business plans; long-term financial planning; the Council's performance management; its approach to workforce planning; as well as the alignment between the Council's ICT and Enterprise Architecture functions. The Review team highlighted the need for urgency in addressing these points, recommending that a responding action plan should be developed within 30 days. The accompanying Cabinet report set out a number of areas which had already been addressed since the Review team had been on-site, including actions to move the Administrations education and economic development priorities forward, the commissioning of a Communications and Media Review; and senior managers coming into post. The Cabinet report also stated that an action plan would be developed for approval at the November Cabinet meeting, and that an overarching Delivery Plan would follow by the end of December 2013.

Scrutiny outcomes

52. The Committee wrote to Leader, Councillor Heather Joyce, to:

- Recommend that the Action Plan should be presented to Full Council for debate in order to ensure shared ownership to drive through the necessary changes to the Council's culture;
- State that the Committee had agreed that it also wished to consider the Action Plan in detail at its November meeting, or if possible in pre-decision at its late October meeting;
- Share its concern that the development of the Action Plan seemed to be officer- rather than Member-led, and to state that the impetus should very much come from elected Members;
- Recommend that the Action Plan should be developed in order to clearly demonstrate outcomes for citizens;
- Note that the findings of the Review endorsed the Committee's own comments about the 2013-17 Corporate Plan;
- Request to consider the results of the Communications and Media review, in order to inform the Committee's planned inquiry into public engagement, and to recommend that employee engagement ;
- Highlight the Review's recommendation that the internal resources devoted to economic development be replaced with externally-funded resources where possible;
- Reiterate its recommendation that the Council's asset management should be addressed as a matter of urgency;
- Note the issues highlighted with the Council's internal Personal Performance and Development Review process, and emphasise that the process should be about the quality of the reviews and management of individual staff performance and not simply about compliance levels;
- Communicate the Committee's concern regarding the Council's budget monitoring position.

Cabinet response

53. *The Leader responded that many of the issues highlighted by the Peer Review had been ones about which the Cabinet was already aware, such as the lack of senior*

management capacity. She stated that a high-level response would be considered by the Cabinet in November 2013, followed by an overarching Delivery Plan in early 2014 and that she envisage the latter would be more appropriate for the Committee to consider. The Cabinet's high-level response was presented to the November 2013 of Full Council, as recommended.

Welsh Local Government Association Peer Review – Cabinet response

Context

54. The Committee the high level response to the WLGA Peer Review at its 7 January 2014 meeting. The response stated that, while it had originally been envisaged that an Action Plan would be developed responding to each specific recommendation, it had since been recognised that a more strategic response to the wider context of the challenges identified was required. This would include a refresh of the Corporate Plan, improved service planning and a series of service reviews. The new Chief Executive, attending the meeting, informed the Committee, that these strands would be brought together into a 'road map' for the Council for the next three years.

Scrutiny outcomes

55. The Committee wrote to the Leader, Councillor Heather Joyce, to:

- Note the changed approach to responding to the recommendations of the Peer Review, in terms of using a more holistic methodology, but to also emphasise that the need for urgency which was apparent in the Review's findings, should not be forgotten;
- Stress that the Council's direction of travel should continue to be communicated to staff and citizens, given the financial pressures was needed. The Committee further emphasised that a comprehensive approach to employee engagement should be taken;
- Note that the Chief Executive was intending to address the Council's management structure in a holistic way and state that Members hoped that this was something in which the Committee would continue to be engaged.

Cabinet response

56. *The Leader responded that she was pleased that the Committee appeared to endorse the more holistic approach and noted the Committee's recommendations about external and internal engagement. An engagement strand has since been added to the Council's organisational development initiative, as presented to the Committee in May 2014.*

Wales Audit Office Improvement Report and Letter

Context

57. At its special meeting on 15 October 2013, in addition to considering the WLGA's Peer Review, the Committee also heard from the Wales Audit Office with regards to their assessment of the how Cardiff Council is performing its improvement duties. The WAO has a duty under the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2009 to produce an Annual Improvement report as well as an Annual Improvement Letter assessing:

- Integrating Strategy and Delivery
- Improvement
- Improvement Information
- Collaboration
- Accounting for Improvement

58. A representative of the WAO attended Committee to present the Auditor General's findings, which this year were set out in one document. The WAO's report made one proposal for improvement, for the Council to urgently establish its priorities for improvement for 2013/14 (something which had been addressed by the Cabinet at the same meeting which received the WAO's Report). Echoing comments previously made by the Committee, the WAO also made a number for comments about the need for the Council to review its performance management arrangements, in terms of ensuring robust measures and targets were in place to track delivery of the Corporate Plan and improvement objectives. The Auditor General made further proposals for improvement, recommending that the Council

should develop its performance management arrangements to ensure that objectives were clear and alignment with service delivery was plainly set out, and that the Council's Improvement Report was made more accessible.

Scrutiny outcomes

59. The Committee wrote to the Deputy Leader, Councillor Ralph Cook, to:

- Urge the Cabinet to consider the recommendations made at the meeting in terms of making the Council's Improvement report more accessible, for example by providing an 'easy read' summary linking to the more detailed data behind it; by providing the report in other community languages or by targeting its distribution to certain stakeholder groups;
- Reiterate comments the Committee had made when it considered the draft 2013-17 Corporate Plan in February 2013, that clear and measurable targets should be set out and outcomes for citizens established;
- Note the Auditor General's comment that comparative performance data should be included in future performance reports. Given the Committee's own interest in this area, Members decided to commission research from the Scrutiny Research Team about performance benchmarking. Further details are below.

Cabinet response

60. *The Deputy Leader confirmed that a summary version of the Council's Improvement report would be completed and published in English and Welsh on the Council's website. It would also be signposted using avenues such as the Council's twitter feed, the Capital Times and at various buildings across the city. The Deputy Leader confirmed that a refreshed version of the Council's Corporate Plan would be published in February 2014 and that this would include more measurable outcomes. He also welcomed the Committee's decision to commission benchmarking research.*

2013/14 Performance Monitoring

Context

61. The Committee scrutinised the delivery of the Administration's vision for the city through consideration of quarterly performance reports to the Cabinet.

Scrutiny outcomes

62. Across its various considerations of corporate performance, the Committee wrote to the Leader and to:

- Welcome the inclusion of further sickness absence data, as previously recommended by the Committee;
- Recommend that further information request data should be included to ensure that this important area was kept at high up the Cabinet's agenda;
- Recommend greater challenge around performance targets being set by Directorates;
- Request further details of the Plan which was under development to transform the Council's services;
- Recommend that the Corporate overview of Council performance should be improved.

Cabinet response

63. *The Committee's views have been taken into account as the Council's performance reporting and framework develops and the Committee continues to work closely with the Cabinet on the subject.*

Performance Benchmarking

Context

64. The Committee has for a long time underlined that benchmarking the Council's performance is an essential part of the drive to improve. Members been informed by Cabinet Members and officers that identifying suitable comparators is a difficult task. Comparisons within Wales are often judged to be ineffective, given Cardiff's

particular characteristics as capital city, while comparisons outside Wales can be complicated by differing performance regimes and methodologies. The Committee therefore commissioned the Scrutiny Research Team to undertake a research project to examine the feasibility of benchmarking Cardiff Council's performance against other local authorities.

Scrutiny outcomes

65. The Scrutiny Research report considered different types of benchmarking and approaches used, as well as highlight some key challenges in undertaking performance benchmarking. Interviews were undertaken with performance officers across the Council to establish what benchmarking activity was already taking place at a local level and with experts such as the Local Government Data to examine best practice. The research was commended to the Cabinet.

Cabinet response

66. *The Cabinet is keen to put in place more effective benchmarking practices to enhance the Council's performance arrangements. As part of the Council's performance review under the Organisational Development programme, discussed below, benchmarking opportunities are being explored.*

Performance Review

Context

67. Having been informed by the new Chief Executive that reviewing the Council's performance management was a key priority, the Committee were briefed on the arrangements being put in place at its March 2014 meeting.

Scrutiny outcomes

68. The Committee wrote to the Leader to:

- Welcome the Chief Executive's willingness to work constructively with Scrutiny and that he was taking a strong approach in addressing the Council's performance;

- Comment that there is an important balance to be struck between creating an environment in which performance can be openly discussed, but in which performance is also penalised;
- Emphasise Members' view that the Council should aim to benchmark more of its performance as well as share good practice within the Council more;
- Make some brief comments about the new draft quarterly performance template which was presented to the meeting, in terms of the need to allow satisfactory tracking between reporting periods; the need for more historical data; the inclusion of wider information to reflect the customer point of view; and the requirement for effective challenge of the information put forward by Directorates.

Cabinet response

69. *The Committee is awaiting a response.*

Review of the Post of Chief Executive

Context

70. The Committee scrutinised the proposals for a revised senior management structure during the 2012/13 municipal year. Following an announcement by the then Chief Executive Jon House that he would be leaving the Council in summer 2013, the Committee convened a special meeting to carry out pre-decision scrutiny of proposals to Review the post of Chief Executive, which were to be presented to the Cabinet the following day. Three options were set out to replace the Chief Executive:

- Option 1: Appointment of Shared Chief Executive/Managing Director with a Neighbouring Council
- Option 2: Appointment of New Chief Executive on a like-for-like basis
- Option 3: Appointment of New City Director.

71. The report stated that the Cabinet was minded to follow the third option, which had the potential to generate a financial saving for the Council, given that the role would carry out fewer external-facing duties. The report also proposed interim

arrangements while the recruitment process went on, to ensure that the statutory post of Head of Paid Service was filled during this period. The report stated that a member of the senior management team could be appointed on an interim basis so that the Council could accept the offer of the WLGA to provide an individual for three months as part of the Peer Review process, at no additional cost to the Council. The report indicated that the latter was the Cabinet's preferred option.

Scrutiny outcomes

72. The Committee wrote to then Leader, Councillor Heather Joyce:

- Setting out the Committee's concern that the interim solution funded by the WLGA would still present a considerable cost to the public and risked leaving the Council without a Head of Paid Service for a period, given that recruitment would be likely to take more than three months;
- Stating that this option seemed to be at odds with the Administration's intention to use fewer external consultants and instead to build up internal capacity. The proposed appointment also seemed to create a conflict of interest as the Interim appointee would continue as a member of the Peer Review team;
- Recommending that an internal interim acting up arrangement should be put in place until recruitment;
- Outlining concerns around the role of City Director, in terms of the duties which would pass to Cabinet Members, and the status which such a post would have.
- Stating firmly that the Committee was unconvinced by the evidence base for the shift to a City Director role, and similarly had concerns about the option of sharing a Chief Executive with a neighbouring authority. Members recommended instead that a Chief Executive should be recruited, encouraging the Employment Conditions Committee to consider an appointment on a spot salary at the lower end of the post's pay scale.

Cabinet response

73. *The day after the Committee meeting, the Cabinet met and adjourned to allow more time to consider the scrutiny comments before reaching a final conclusion about the post. When Cabinet reconvened a week later, the Committee's recommendations were agreed: Cabinet recommended to Council to designate the*

Corporate Director – Resources as Interim Head of Paid Service; that a recruitment process commence to find a new Chief Executive; and that the Employment Conditions Committee be recommended to agree the appointment on a spot salary. The Leader expressed her appreciation for the Committee’s engagement on the matter.

Cardiff Council Web Refresh Project

Context

74. The Committee has taken a strong interest in the development of the Council’s website, feeling that its structure and functionality should be improved to better serve Cardiff’s citizens. In recent years the website has been rated quite poorly by the Society of Information Technology Management’s annual review of local authority websites. In June 2013, the Committee was briefed on a new project to update the Council’s website. Members received a further update in April 2014 prior to the new-look website’s soft launch, when the Committee was able to scrutinise the governance arrangements which were being put in place to ensure that the website remained fit for purpose.

Scrutiny outcomes

75. The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member for Social Care and Wellbeing, who at the time had responsibility for corporate communications, and later to the Deputy Leader, to:

- Note that changes to the website were part of a wider initiative to improve customer access to Council services;
- Note the Deputy Leader’s commitment following questions at the meeting that Elected Members would be involved in the ongoing governance of the website;
- Express concern about the timescales for making changes to the website;
- Reiterate the point which the Committee has previously made that Council service must remain accessible to all citizens, via different methods;
- Recommend that further thought is given to how social media can be used as an access route to services;

- Recommend a joined-up approach with the Improvement and Information Team to ensure the proper management of information;
- Express the Committee's concern that the website may not be sufficiently future-proof as it may rely on bespoke solutions, and that more thought should be given to future regional collaboration when developing the website; and
- Highlight the benefits of management of the website staying centrally-controlled in order to ensure that the web pages remain consistent.

Cabinet response

76. The Cabinet Member replied that serious consideration was being given to the use of social media in accessing services; that accessibility was a key priority and that arrangements had been made to ensure good linkages with the Improvement and Information Team. A response to the Committee's second letter is awaited.

Revised Redeployment Policy

Context

77. In November 2013, the Committee scrutinised proposals to amend Cardiff Council's internal Redeployment Policy, before they were presented to the Cabinet for approval. As part of the Council's update 2014/15 Budget Strategy, it had been agreed to consider changes to the Policy, in order to help meet the financial challenges faced by the Council. At that time around 60 officers were in the Council's redeployment pool, twice the number 12 month previously and a number that was expected to increase sharply. Redeployment at that time could last up to six months, during which time staff could be offered trial placements. Proposals had been drawn up to reduce the redeployment period to 12 weeks. The scheme would also be limited to staff with 4 years continuous service at Cardiff Council, rather than in local government. There would be a greater focus on signposting staff to external support, and posts would initially only be advertised to those on the redeployment register.

Scrutiny outcomes

78. The Committee wrote to the Deputy Leader to:

- Welcome the opportunity to consider the proposals at an early stage;
- Emphasise the need for members of staff on the redeployment register to have access to training;
- Recommend that time spent in training should be discounted from the redeployment period if possible;
- Express the Committee's concern that the Redeployment Team and Panel would not have the capacity to handle a further increase in officers entering the redeployment pool;
- Recommend that these capacity issues should be addressed in the budget or by reallocation of tasks in Human Resources;
- Query how the operation of the Policy would link to the Council's shift towards alternative delivery mechanisms;
- Recommend that workforce planning should be addressed, given the potential loss of corporate memory and appropriate skills-mix which may result from increasing numbers of officers leaving the authority.

Cabinet response

79. The Deputy Leader replied stating that the recommendation to discount training from the redeployment period had been investigated but disregarded as it may present issues in terms of equality and transparency. Access to training via the Cardiff Academy would be built in at as early a stage as possible, however, and officers had started discussions with Careers Wales and Job Centre Plus in terms of additional support. Temporary funding had also been put in place to bring in temporary staff to support the Redeployment Team.

Social Inclusion

Context

80. The accepted definition of social exclusion is isolation from a "prevailing social system and its rights and privileges, typically as a result of poverty or the fact of belonging to a social group". In 2002-03, the Committee undertook a lengthy inquiry into the effectiveness of the Council's Social Inclusion Action Plan. The Committee wished to re-examine the issue to consider current theories of best

practice in the field, more recent policy drivers, and in particular in order to explore what other public bodies across Europe are doing to increase social inclusion. The Committee therefore commissioned the Scrutiny Research Team to undertake a review.

Scrutiny outcomes

81. The research report established that effective practice has been to move away from the traditional custom of putting in place an overarching strategy to tackle multiple forms of exclusion. This kind of action plan had been difficult to implement and monitor given the wide ranging topics and multiple service areas which they had covered. As such, many cities have focused on specific target groups, and concentrated their resources at tackling one issue at a time. The report identified a number of inclusion projects across Europe from which Cardiff could learn. These included Birmingham Council's Arts Champion Scheme which had brought arts and cultural activities into constituencies across the city, for example through Birmingham Repertory Theatre setting up a youth theatre in an area of the city where many young people's families had never worked. Bologna Authority has put social clauses into their contracts to support people through an active inclusion job placement scheme.

Cabinet response

82. The Cabinet Member for Community Development, Co-operatives and Social Enterprise was invited to attend Committee as the report was presented and welcomed the research. The Committee has recommended that the issues should be explored further as part of the 2014/15 work programme.

Organisational Change Programme

Context

83. The Committee scrutinised proposals to create a three-year major programme of change to enable the Council to respond positively to the challenges it faces. The Leader and Chief Executive, the Cabinet Member for Corporate Services and Performance and officers set out plans to establish five change programmes, a

Peer Challenge Group to bring an external perspective on the Council's improvement journey, and internal governance arrangements.

Scrutiny outcomes

84. The Committee wrote to Leader to:

- Commend the approach presented, recognising that the Council needs to change to meet external pressures and internal challenges;
- Stating that the Committee would look in future to see the Programme's outcomes and potential savings more clearly defined, given the £1.7 million which had been set aside to fund the work;
- Note that there were a number of areas previously identified as issues by the Committee would be addressed by the Programme, including workforce planning, asset management, customer management and employee and public engagement;
- Query whether there was sufficient appetite for change across the Council;
- Recommend that the Cabinet considers bringing together a team to develop capacity within communities to bring forward alternative delivery method proposals;
- Recommend that a strong feedback loop should be built into the Strategic Commissioning programme;
- Support the creation of the 'Cardiff Debate' engagement programme;
- Request more clarity on the resourcing of the Organisational Change Programme;
- Recommend that the Peer Challenge Group should have an external Chair to ensure it has an independent voice, rather than be chaired by the Leader;
- Recommend that a formal reporting mechanism should be established to Scrutiny and the Cabinet.

Cabinet response

85. *The Leader, Councillor Phil Bale, responded positively to the Chair's letter, reiterating his commitment to the Scrutiny function and stating that Scrutiny involvement would be critical to the Organisational Change Programme's development and implementation. He assured the Committee that the Chief*

Executive and Senior Management were ready to drive change forward. A feedback mechanism would be built into the Programme and officers would investigate how to mobilise resources to support communities in developing alternative delivery methods. The Leader noted the Committee's recommendation regarding the 'Change Challenge Forum' (as the 'Peer' group had been renamed), but stating that he believed it should be chaired by someone directly accountable to the public.

Community Hubs Proposals

Context

86. The Committee nominated five representatives to sit on a sub-committee, with similar sub-committees of the Economy and Culture and Community & Adult Service Scrutiny Committees, to give pre-decision scrutiny to proposals to establish community hubs in Ely/Caerau and Splott/Tremorfa. Community Hubs are at the forefront of the Council's Customer Management strategy. The sub-committee has since reconvened to consider proposals for Pentwyn and Grangetown. The meetings garnered significant levels of public interest, with stakeholders from several communities giving evidence to Members.

Public Sector Asset Management

Context

87. In addition to the issues set out above which were scrutinised in some detail, the Committee also received a report of the Cardiff Partnership Board Scrutiny Panel, dealing with Public Sector Asset Management. The Committee has a longstanding interest in the Council's management of its assets, and in particular its strategic estate, having pushed for some time that the Cabinet should set out a clear vision for its future operation.

Scrutiny outcomes

88. The Committee wrote to the Cabinet Member for Finance & Economic Development commending the report. The Committee is hoping to consider the draft Property Strategy in the near future.

Future work programme opportunities for 2014/15

89. The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items received from members of the public, young people, organisations, Council Members and other Scrutiny Committees, for inclusion on the work programme. Committee Members can also suggest any new issues which may be of interest to the Committee. Presently the following issues are being considered for inclusion in the coming year's work programme, having been identified during the course of the 2013/14 work programme, or because they were not able to be considered due to slippage or pressures of additional items :

- Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment
- Property Strategy
- Communications Review
- Directorate Delivery Plans
- Management restructure
- Social inclusion activity
- Organisational Development programme and Change Challenge Forum
- SAP Customer Relationship Management
- Welsh Language Standards

90. The following items have been suggested for consideration as issues which may be suitable for a Task & Finish Inquiry:

- Community Infrastructure Levy
- Public Engagement

91. It is suggested that the Committee continues to receive the regular progress and performance reports on:

- Corporate Performance Monitoring
- Budget Monitoring.

Scrutiny Services, City & County of Cardiff
Room 243, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff CF10 4UW
Tel: 029 2087 2296. Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk
© 2014 City & County of Cardiff